

REPORT NO.

283



सत्यमेव जयते

PARLIAMENT OF INDIA
RAJYA SABHA

DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE
ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS

TWO HUNDRED EIGHTY THIRD REPORT

**Demands for Grants (2016-17) of the
Ministry of Environment, Forest &
Climate Change (Demand No. 32)**

(Presented to the Rajya Sabha on 9th May, 2016)
(Laid on the Table of Lok Sabha on 9th May, 2016)



Rajya Sabha Secretariat, New Delhi
May, 2016/Vaisakha, 1938 (Saka)

Website : <http://rajyasabha.nic.in>
E-mail : rsc-st@sansad.nic.in

Hindi version of this publication is also available

**PARLIAMENT OF INDIA
RAJYA SABHA**

**DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE
ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS**

TWO HUNDRED EIGHTY THIRD REPORT

**Demands for Grants (2016-17) of the
Ministry of Environment, Forest &
Climate Change (Demand No. 32)**

*(Presented to the Rajya Sabha on 9th May, 2016)
(Laid on the Table of Lok Sabha on 9th May, 2016)*

**Rajya Sabha Secretariat, New Delhi
May, 2016/Vaisakha, 1938 (Saka)**

CONTENTS

	PAGES
1. COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE	(i)-(iv)
2. INTRODUCTION	(v)
3. ACRONYMS	(vi)-(vii)
4. REPORT	1-21
5. RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS — AT A GLANCE.....	22-26
6. MINUTES	27-33

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE

(2015-16)

(Constituted on 1st September, 2015)

1. Shri Ashwani Kumar — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

2. Shri Anil Madhav Dave
3. Shri Prem Chand Gupta
4. Shri C.P. Narayanan
5. Shri Parimal Nathwani
6. Shri Paul Manoj Pandian
7. Dr. T. Subbarami Reddy
8. Shri Arvind Kumar Singh
9. Shri Bhupinder Singh
10. Shri Ronald Sapa Tlau

LOK SABHA

11. Shri Badruddin Ajmal
12. Shri Muzaffar Hussain Baig
13. Shrimati Bijoya Chakraborty
14. Shri Prabhatsinh Chauhan
15. Shri Pankaj Chowdhary
16. Kum. Sushmita Dev
17. Shri Ninong Ering
18. Shri Laxman Giluwa
19. Dr. K. Gopal
20. Shri Daddan Mishra
21. Shri Chirag Paswan
22. Shri Shivaji A. Patil
23. Shri Nana Patole
24. Shri Nagendra Kumar Pradhan
25. Shri Harinarayan Rajbhar
26. Shrimati Sandhya Roy
27. Shri Kirti Vardhan Singh
28. Shri Nagendra Singh
29. Shrimati Renuka Sinha
30. Shri Vikram Usendi
31. Shrimati M. Vasanthi

(ii)

SECRETARIAT

Shri M.K. Khan, *Joint Secretary*

Shri Rohtas, *Director*

Shri Mohd. Salamuddin, *Deputy Director*

Shri Rajiv Saxena, *Assistant Director*

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE

(2015-16)

(Constituted on 1st September, 2015)

*1. Smt. Renuka Chowdhury — *Chairperson*

RAJYA SABHA

2. Shri Anil Madhav Dave
3. Shri Prem Chand Gupta
4. Shri C.P. Narayanan
5. Shri Parimal Nathwani
6. Shri Paul Manoj Pandian
7. Dr. T. Subbarami Reddy
8. Shri Arvind Kumar Singh
9. Shri Bhupinder Singh
10. Shri Ronald Sapa Tlau

LOK SABHA

11. Shri Badruddin Ajmal
12. Shri Muzaffar Hussain Baig
13. Shrimati Bijoya Chakraborty
14. Shri Prabhatsinh Chauhan
15. Shri Pankaj Chowdhary
16. Kum. Sushmita Dev
17. Shri Ninong Ering
18. Shri Laxman Giluwa
19. Dr. K. Gopal
20. Shri Daddan Mishra
21. Shri Chirag Paswan
22. Shri Shivaji A. Patil
23. Shri Nana Patole
24. Shri Nagendra Kumar Pradhan
25. Shri Harinarayan Rajbhar
26. Shrimati Sandhya Roy
27. Shri Kirti Vardhan Singh
28. Shri Nagendra Singh
29. Shrimati Renuka Sinha
30. Shri Vikram Usendi
31. Shrimati M. Vasanthi

* Nominated w.e.f. 21st April, 2016

SECRETARIAT

Shri M.K. Khan, *Joint Secretary*

Shri Mohd. Salamuddin, *Deputy Director*

Shri Rajiv Saxena, *Assistant Director*

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science and Technology, Environment and Forests, having been authorised by the Committee to present the Report on its behalf, present this Two Hundred Eighty-third Report of the Committee. This Report deals with the detailed Demands for Grants (2016-17) of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (Demand No. 32).

2. In the meeting of the Committee held on the 30th March, 2016, the Secretary and other Officers of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change gave an overview of the various activities of the Ministry and the Members sought clarifications on various aspects of the performance of the Ministry to enable it to scrutinise the Demands for Grants.

3. The Committee expresses its thanks to the Officers of the Ministry for replying to the clarifications sought by the Members and placing before it the required material to enable the Committee to scrutinise the Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change.

4. The Committee considered and adopted the Report at its meeting held on the 5th May, 2016.

NEW DELHI;
5 May, 2016

Vaisakha 15, 1938 (Saka)

RENUKA CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on
Science and Technology, Environment and Forests,
Rajya Sabha.

ACRONYMS

BE	:	Budget Estimate
BRs	:	Biosphere Reserves
CITES	:	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species
CPCB	:	Central Pollution Control Board
CRZ	:	Coastal Regulation Zone
CSIR	:	Council of Scientific and Industrial Research
CSS	:	Centrally Sponsored Schemes
EcRP	:	Ecosystems Research Programme
EIA	:	Environmental Impact Assessment
EnvRP	:	Environmental Research Programme
FSI	:	Forest Survey of India
GBPIHED	:	G.B. Pant National Institute of Himalayan Environment & Sustainable Development
GIM	:	Green India Mission
GIS	:	Geographic Information System
ICAR	:	Indian Council of Agricultural Research
ICMR	:	Indian Council of Medical Research
ICSSR	:	Indian Council of Social Science Research
MAB	:	Man and Biosphere
MAPs	:	Management Action Plans
MIS	:	Management Information System
MoWR, RD&GR	:	Ministry of Water Resources, River Development and Ganga Rejuvenation
NAEB	:	National Afforestation & Eco-Development Board
NAFCC	:	National Adaptation Fund on Climate Change
NAP	:	National Afforestation Programme
NBA	:	National Biodiversity Authority
NCEF	:	National Clean Energy Fund
NIE	:	National Implementing Entity
NLCP	:	National Lake Conservation Plan

NNRMS	:	National Natural Resources Management System
NPCA	:	National Plan for Conservation of Aquatic Eco-Systems
NRCD	:	National River Conservation Directorate
NTCA	:	National Tiger Conservation Authority
PA	:	Protected Area
PC-NNRMS	:	Planning Committee-National Natural Resources Management System
PFMS	:	Public Finance Management System
R&D	:	Research and Development
RE	:	Revised Estimate
SAC	:	Space Application Centre
SPCBs/PCCs	:	State Pollution Control Boards/Pollution Control Committees
STP	:	Sewage Treatment Plant
UNESCO	:	United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
WII	:	Wildlife Institute of India
ZSI	:	Zoological Survey of India

REPORT

INTRODUCTION

The Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change is the nodal agency in the administrative structure of the Central Government for planning, promoting, coordinating and overseeing environmental, ecological, forestry and wildlife policies and programmes. The mandate of Ministry is to ensure better environment management and preservation of biodiversity including wildlife thereby providing a thrust to Swachhh Bharat Abhiyan. Its main activities include conservation and survey of natural resources including flora, fauna, forests, wildlife, aquatic bodies and water resources, and eco-systems, prevention and control of pollution and management of hazardous substances, protection of the environment and forests, including their biodiversity, mitigation and adaptation to climate change through measures that include afforestation, regeneration of degraded areas, and adoption of cleaner technologies, and promoting sustainable development and better environmental governance while protecting human, plants and animals life, health and welfare.

1.2 The main tools used to discharge its mandate include *inter alia* conducting surveys; collecting, compiling and disseminating data and information; undertaking scientific research, extension services and analyses; carrying out impact assessment of developmental projects and programmes; regulating use of natural resources; undertaking regeneration programmes; extending technical, scientific, financial and administrative support to organisations and institutions in the subject field; imparting education, training, building capacity and generating awareness among stakeholders and the public at large and promoting international cooperation through bilateral, regional and multilateral initiatives in environment and ecology.

1.3 The organizational structure of the Ministry covers a number of Directorates, Divisions, Regional Offices, Subordinate Offices, Boards, Autonomous Institutions and Public Sector Undertakings. The following main wings of the Ministry are:

- (i) Environment;
- (ii) Climate Change;
- (iii) National River Conservation Directorate;
- (iv) National Afforestation and Eco-Development Board;
- (v) Wildlife; and
- (vi) Animal Welfare.

1.4 Ten Regional Offices of the Ministry, located at Bengaluru, Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Chandigarh, Chennai, Dehradun, Lucknow, Nagpur, Ranchi and Shillong perform the functions of monitoring and evaluation of on-going forestry development projects and schemes with specific emphasis on conservation of forests and follow up on implementation of conditions and safeguards laid down by the Ministry for project activities where environmental clearance is given.

1.5 The Ministry also has the following subordinate offices:

- (i) Botanical Survey of India, Kolkata
- (ii) Zoological Survey of India, Kolkata

- (iii) National Museum of Natural History, New Delhi
- (iv) Indira Gandhi National Forest Academy, Dehradun
- (v) Directorate of Forest Education, Dehradun
- (vi) Forest Survey of India, Dehradun
- (vii) National Zoological Park, New Delhi, and
- (viii) National Institute of Animal Welfare, Faridabad

1.6 For the attainment of its objectives, the Ministry extends financial support to the following autonomous institutes/statutory bodies/registered societies:

Environment & Ecology

- (i) Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB), Delhi
- (ii) G.B. Pant National Institute of Himalayan Environment and Sustainable Development (GBPIHED), Almora
- (iii) National Biodiversity Authority (NBA), Chennai
- (iv) Society for Integrated Coastal Management (SICOM)
- (v) 10 Centres of Excellence

Forestry and Wildlife

- (i) Indian Council of Forestry Research and Education (ICFRE), Dehradun [with 9 research institutes and 4 advanced centers]
- (ii) Indian Plywood Industries Research and Training Institute (IPIRTI), Bengaluru
- (iii) Indian Institute of Forest Management (IIFM), Bhopal
- (iv) Wildlife Institute of India (WII), Dehradun
- (v) Central Zoo Authority (CZA), New Delhi
- (vi) Wildlife Crime Control Bureau, New Delhi
- (vii) National Tiger Conservation Authority (NTCA), New Delhi
- (viii) Animal Welfare Board of India (AWBI), Chennai)

1.7 The Ministry also has one public Sector Undertaking viz., the Andaman and Nicobar Islands Forest Plantation Development Corporation Limited at Port Blair.

1.8 The Ministry is also the nodal Ministry for United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD) and Multilateral Environmental Agreements (MEAs). The Ministry also coordinates with multilateral bodies such as United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification (UNCCD), United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD). It is also focal point of the Global Environment

Facility (GEF) and regional bodies such as Economic and Social Council for Asia and Pacific (ESCAP) and South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC).

1.9 The Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Science & Technology, Environment & Forests considered the Demands for Grants (2016-17) of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change in its meeting held on 30th March, 2016, which *inter alia* included the following aspects:-

RATIONALIZATION OF PLAN SCHEMES

2.1 The Ministry has rationalised 8 Schemes of Eleventh Plan to 5 in Twelfth Plan by suitable merger thereby reducing the total number of thematic schemes from 22 to 18, comprising of 5 Centrally Sponsored Schemes (CSS) and 13 Central Sector Schemes. The rationalization of CSS in the Twelfth Plan is as under:

Restructured composition of 12th Plan Period

1. National River Conservation Programme

* NRCD

* NRCP

2. Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems

* Conservation of Mangroves, Coral

* National Plan for Conservation of Aquatic Ecosystems (incl. NLCP and Wetlands)

* Biosphere Reserves

* BCRLIP

* Environmental Management in Heritage & Tourist including Taj Protection

3. National Mission for Green India

* National Afforestation Programme

* Intensification of Forest Management Scheme

* Green India Mission

4. Wildlife Management

* Integrated Development of Wildlife Habitats

* Project Elephant

* Project Tiger

2.2 Similarly, the structure of Plan Schemes has undergone a change from 2016-17. Accordingly, the revised structure of 9 Umbrella Schemes operated by the Ministry are as follows:

(i) Education and Training

(ii) Assistance to Autonomous Bodies

(iii) Survey and Research

(iv) Environmental Protection and Monitoring

- (v) Boards, Authorities and Tribunals
- (vi) National Coastal Zone Management Programme
- (vii) National Action Plan on Climate Change
- (viii) (a) National Mission for a Green India
 - (b) Integrated Development of Wildlife Habitats
 - (c) Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems
- (ix) National River Conservation Programme

2.3 The Committee was informed that from financial year 2014-15, the sub-scheme of National Ganga River Basin Authority (NGRBA) Scheme under the Plan Scheme of National River Conservation Plan has been transferred to Ministry of Water Resources. A new Scheme titled 'National Mission on Himalayan Studies' with an outlay of ₹ 100.00 crore has been introduced in 2014-15.

2.4 Further, the Scheme on Climate Change has been upgraded to a standalone thematic scheme with incorporation of new sub Scheme "National Adaptation Fund for Climate Change" introduced in 2014-15. Amongst Sub-Schemes, those on Industrial Pollution Abatement through Preventive Strategies and Clean Technologies have been merged into one under Pollution Abatement. Similarly, the schemes of National Lake Conservation Plan (NLCP) and Wetlands have been merged into one on "National Plan for Conservation of Aquatic Eco-Systems" (NPCA) under the thematic scheme of "Conservation of Natural Resources & Eco Systems".

2.5 The Committee takes note of the rationalisation and merger of some schemes in the budget allocation of the Department and hopes that the merger of the schemes will provide the required flexibility to the Ministry for the implementation of the schemes.

FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE OF THE DEPARTMENT

3.1 Against the proposed allocation of ₹ 47,586 crore for the 12th Five Year Plan, the approved outlay of Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change was ₹ 17,874 crore. The B.E. and R.E. allocations and actual utilisations for the 12th Plan period, year-wise, for the year 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16 together with the allocation made in 2016-17 of the Ministry are as under:-

<i>(₹ in Crore)</i>				
Year	BE	RE	Expenditure	Utilization of BE (%)
2012-13	2430.00	1800.00	1636.00	67.33
2013-14	2430.00	1850.00	1811.34	74.54
2014-15	2043.00	1550.00	1523.33	74.56
2015-16	1556.60	1693.69	1314.68	84.45
			[upto Feb 2016]	
2016-17	2000.00	—	—	—

3.2 The Committee observes that against the approved outlay of ₹ 17,874 crore, the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change was allocated only ₹ 8459.60 crore during the first four years of the 12th Plan and the same was reduced to ₹ 6893.69 crore at R. E. Stage. In 2016-17, allocation of ₹ 2000.00 crore has been made to the Department, raising the actual total allocation of the Department to ₹ 10459.60 crore, which is only 58.51 percent of the allocated approved for the 12th Five Year Plan. The Ministry was able to spend only 67.33% 74.54% and 74.56% of the B.E. allocation during 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15 respectively and 84.45% of the B.E. allocation upto February, 2016 in 2015-16.

3.3 The Ministry informed the Committee that the lower utilization in 2015-16 is mainly on account of general administrative and procedural reasons, like delays in receipt of proposals, lack of adequate proposals, non/late submission of Utilization Certificates, revalidation of unspent balances, completion of works, etc. In many schemes, implementing agencies are State Governments/Forest Departments, whose performance depends on timely release of matching grants. Time lag in release of funds by the Ministry and actual availability of funds to such implementing agencies also impacts on the performance of these schemes. Regular meetings are held with the Divisional Heads in charge of the Programmes/Schemes to expedite utilization levels. Instructions have been issued to the Programme Divisions/autonomous bodies/attached offices from time to time to improve the pace of utilization.

3.4 The Committee is of the view that the very purpose of formulation of schemes/programme during the Five Year Plans is defeated if adequate financial allocations are not made for them in time. It also has an adverse bearing on the execution of these projects. The Committee is disappointed to note that instead of being provided the approved allocation, the Ministry has been provided only 58.51 percent of its approved outlay, thereby adversely affecting the schemes/programmes of the Ministry in the 12th Five Year Plan.

3.5 The Committee observes that although the actual utilisation of the allocated funds of the Ministry has been steadily increasing during the last few years, the performance of the Department in terms of utilisation of funds leaves much to be desired. The Ministry could utilise only 84.45 percent of the allocation upto February, 2016. Most of the reasons cited by the Ministry for under-utilisation of funds are administrative and procedural which could have been avoided. This also shows lack of planning and foresightedness on part of the Ministry. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry should undertake a review of its financial performance during the last few years and try to identify the bottlenecks responsible for not being able to optimally utilise the funds at its disposal so as to improve its performance on this front in the future.

BUDGET ALLOCATION OF THE YEAR 2016-17

4.1 The Ministry has informed that it had proposed an outlay of ₹ 3880.06/- crore for 2016-17 which includes ₹ 1000 crore to be sourced from National Clean Energy Fund (NCEF). However, the approved allocation of this Ministry for 2016-17 is only ₹ 2000 crore. The sector-wise distributions of the approved outlay for 2016-17 are as below:

(₹ in Crore)

Sector	2015-16 BE	2015-16 RE	2016-17 BE	Percentage increase in 2016-17 over 2015-16	
				BE/BE	BE/RE
1. Environment	723.16	802.74	827.49	14.43%	3.08%
2. NRCD#	81.00	113.63	162.00	100%	42.57%
3. Forests & Wildlife	558.94	575.82	787.50	40.90%	36.76%
4. NAEB@	182.00	190.00	210.01	15.39%	10.53%
5. Animal Welfare	11.50	11.50	13.00	13.04%	13.04%
TOTAL (1-5)	1556.60*	1693.69^	2000.00\$	28.49%	18.09%

National River Conservation Directorate (NRCD) and NPCA.

@ National Afforestation & Eco-Development Board (NAEB), NAP and GIM

* Includes ₹ 110 crore sourced from NCEF

^ Includes ₹ 247.09 crore sourced from NCEF (including ₹ 120 crore for Waste to Energy Plant at East Delhi)

\$ Includes ₹ 1000 crore sourced form NCEF

4.2 The changes in outlays of 9 Umbrella Schemes in 2016-17 over 2015-16 RE are as under:

(₹ in Crore)

Name of Scheme	2015-16 BE	2015-16 RE	2016-17 BE	Change over
				2015-16 RE (%)
1. Education and Training	111.47	110.49	103	-6.8%
2. Assistance to Autonomous Bodies	158.8	169.6	195	15.0%
3. Survey and research	135.49	137.82	155.5	12.8%
4. Environmental Protection and Monitoring	120.46	123.27	149.5	21.3%
5. Boards/ Authorities / Tribunals	93.82	92.97	136	46.3%
6. National Coastal Management Programme	100	116	223.98	93.1%
7. National Action Plan on Climate Change	275.01	333.89	180	-46.1%
8. (a) Green India Mission: National Afforestation Programme	213.5	221.5	235.01	6.1%
(b) Integrated Development of Wildlife Habitats	238.91	246.38	420	70.5%
(c) Conservation of Natural resources and Ecosystems	63.14	68.04	100.01	47.0%
9. National River Conservation Programme	46	73.73	102	38.3%
TOTAL	1556.6*	1693.69^	2000\$	18.1%

*Includes ₹ 110 crore sourced from NCEF. (₹ 64 crore for GIM & ₹ 46 crore for NRCD)

^Includes ₹ 247.09 crore sourced from NCEF (including ₹ 120 crore for Waste to Energy Plant at East Delhi)

\$ includes ₹ 1000 crore sourced form NCEF

4.3 The mandate of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change is to ensure better environment management and preservation of biodiversity including Wildlife. Although the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change has been allocated 18.1 % more funds compared to the allocation made in R.E. 2015-16, the Committee is of the view that allocations are not sufficient for the Ministry to effectively discharge its functions. In view of the importance of the task mandated to the Ministry which has all the more relevance in the day-to-day life of all of us and our surroundings, the Committee recommends that the budgetary allocation of the Ministry should be suitably enhanced at R.E. stage to enable the Ministry to discharge its mandate effectively.

ANALYSIS OF SCHEMES/PROGRAMMES

5. The Committee analysed some of the schemes/programmes under operation alongwith their physical and financial targets and achievements in respect of plan schemes. The assessment of the Committee has been detailed in the succeeding paragraphs.

FOREST SURVEY OF INDIA

6.1 Forest Survey of India (FSI) is a premier national organization for forest resource assessment working under the Ministry. Besides carrying out forest and tree cover assessments, it is engaged in providing training, research and extension. The major activities of this organisation are:-

- i) Forest Cover Assessment every two years using Remote Sensing technology.
- ii) Inventory of Forests and Trees outside Forests (Research & Urban areas).
- iii) Methodology design for carrying out various types of survey and inventory.
- iv) Training and Extension.
- v) Projects and Consultancies.

6.2 The performance review of the Forest Survey of India for the year 2015-16 *inter alia* indicates as under: -

Targets	Achievement
Inventory of Forest	Inventory of Forest
(a) Inventory data collection of 30 districts	(a) Data collection 12 districts
(b) Data checking and entry 30 districts	(b) Data checking 10 districts
(c) Data processing and output 30 districts	(c) Data processing and output completed-8 districts
Inventory of TOF (Urban)	Inventory of TOF (Urban)
(a) Inventory data collection of 30 districts	(a) Data collection 11 districts
(b) Data checking & entry 30 districts	(b) Data checking and entry-13 districts
(c) Data processing & output 30 districts	(c) Data processing and output-8 districts

Targets		Achievement	
Inventory of TOF (Research)		Inventory of TOF (Research)	
(a)	Procurement of MX data of 30 Districts	(a)	Procurement of MX data -30 districts
(b)	Image processing and sample collection of 30 sample Districts	(b)	Image processing and sample generation-17 districts
(c)	Inventory data collection of 30 sample Districts	(c)	Inventory data collection - 11 Districts
(d)	Data checking and entry of 30 sample districts	(d)	Data checking and entry – 12 districts
(e)	Data processing and output of 30 districts.	(e)	Data processing and output -8 districts

6.3 The financial performance of the Forest Survey of India, as intimated by the Ministry, is as under:-

(₹ in Crore)

Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
8.13	11.23	7.44	11.91	5.17	9.76

6.4 The Committee notes that although the Forest Survey of India was able to expend nearly 70% of the allocation made upto December, 2015, there is a visible gap in its targets and achievements in the year 2015-16 in terms of Inventory of Forests (Urban and Research). Inventory of Forests is one of the major activities of Forest Survey of India and it failed to achieve its targets in this field. The Committee recommends that Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change and Forest Survey of India should seriously consider the matter and take all necessary measures to ensure that such shortfalls do not recur in future.

ZOOLOGICAL SURVEY OF INDIA (ZSI)

7.1 Zoological Survey of India (ZSI) was established in 1916 primarily to explore and inventories faunal resources (diversity) and to collect and document base line data on taxonomy, distribution, bio-ecology, etc. of all available animal groups. Since then, it has grown from a small unit at the Indian Museum (Kolkata) to a premier National Institution, with Headquarters at Kolkata, and 16 Regional Centres. ZSI serves the nation by providing scientific basis for conservation and sustainable utilization of faunal diversity through survey, inventory, monitoring documentation, capacity building and taxonomic research and creating environmental awareness. The information generated was utilized by different stakeholders.

7.2 Over recent years, functions of ZSI have also expanded gradually encompassing areas like Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) with regard to fauna; survey of Conservation Areas; Status Survey of Endangered Species; Computerization of data on faunal resources; participation in environmental information system (ENVIS) on faunal diversity, etc. It has regular Training and Extension service for

creating public awareness on conservation of environment and wildlife through exhibitions, training programmes and interactions with different Government bodies/NGOs/Universities/ Colleges/Schools. Besides, ZSI acts as custodian of the National Zoological Collections which comprise of over two million specimens belonging to about 80,000 species including about 10,000 species of neighbouring countries (Bangladesh, Myanmar, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Thailand).

7.3 The financial performance of Zoological Survey of India is as under:-

(₹ in Crore)					
Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
31.65	18.78	35.12	20.10	22.33	15.76

7.4 **The Committee observes that Zoological Survey of India was not able to achieve its targets in terms of field surveys, Digitisation of National Zoological Specimen, documentation of species of identified animals, training programme etc. The Zoological Survey of India could also spend only nearly 64% of the plan allocation during 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015). The performance of Zoological Survey of India in terms of both achievements of targets and utilisation of funds, therefore, is not satisfactory and accordingly, the Committee recommends that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change must take urgent remedial measures to ensure that the performance of Zoological Survey of India improves on both these fronts and the allocations made are not underutilised.**

RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

8.1 The Committee was informed that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change is classified as a Scientific Ministry under the Government of India since its inception in 1985. The Ministry has been funding research through Grants-in-Aid projects in identified thrust areas to various organizations (universities, colleges recognized by UGC, institutions of CSIR, ICAR, ICMR, ICSSR and recognized non-governmental scientific organizations) in environment protection and management. The overall objective of the R&D scheme is “to promote basic and applied research in various facets of ecology and environment”. The Ministry informed that it brought out Guidelines for Support to Environmental Research in 2006. In July 2012, revised Guidelines for Support to Environmental Research, 2012 were announced, which *inter-alia*, provide details on the types of research projects which would be sponsored by the Ministry, broad thrust areas of research, eligibility criteria, scope and coverage of research grants, criteria for selection of projects, concept of public-private partnership in Research and Development projects, procedure for invitation, submission, appraisal, monitoring and review of research projects along with norms of funding. The Guidelines also include the terms and conditions governing research grants.

8.2 The Ministry further informed the Committee that it has taken a number of new initiatives to strengthen scientific research in the area of environmental sciences, some of which are as under:-

- (a) Environmental Research Programme (EnvRP): EnvRP specifically deals with “Brown Issues”, *i.e.* problems related to pollution, climate change, hazardous waste management,

agro-chemicals, waste minimization and reuse, carrying capacity studies, development of eco-friendly and cleaner technologies, providing scientific inputs to address policy problems relating to environmental pollution control and management, ecological restoration and bioremediation, environmental health and toxicology, etc.

- (b) Ecosystems Research Programme (EcRP): EcRP deals with “Green Issues” relating to ecology, conservation of natural resources, Eastern and Western Ghats, aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems, Mountain ecosystems, tropical rainforests, wetlands, mangroves and coral reefs, biosphere reserves, biodiversity and study of inter-relationships between man and environment and seeks to generate scientific knowledge needed to manage natural resources wisely.
- (c) Research Programme in Socio-Economic issues of Environment (RPSE): This programme supports research on environmental and ecological economics, socio-economic issues arising out of extant as well as new contemplated legislation(s), tribal, Research, urban issues *vis-a-vis* legislation, role of gram panchayats and civil society in implementing environmental legislation etc.

8.3 The physical performance of the Ministry during 2014-15 and 2015-16 in this sector in as under:

Year	Objectives/ Outcomes	Targets	Achievements
2014-15	Support research in multi-disciplinary aspects of environment protection, conservation and management in identified Thrust Areas	Initiation of new projects: 20	16
		Service on-going projects: 145	105
		Review on-going projects: 145	90
		Prepare Executive Summaries: 20	19
		Initiation of new projects: 20	12
2015-16		Servicing of ongoing projects :145	90
		Review of ongoing projects : 145	85
		Preparation of Executive Summaries of completed projects :20	15

8.4 The actual expenditure 2014-15, R.E. 2015-16 and expenditure 2015-16 (upto December, 2015) under this scheme as under:-

(₹ in Crore)					
Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
5.78	0.00	5.60	0.00	3.97	0.00

8.5 The Committee is dismayed to note the big lag between the targets and achievements of the Ministry in the Research and Development sector in all parameters during 2014-15 and 2015-16. The performance in 2015-16 has also been sharp decline compared to the performance in 2014-15.

Facilitating research and development and investing for the same are extremely important for the development of any nation and for a developing country like India, the critical importance of Research and Development cannot be overemphasized. The Committee is of the opinion that without the desired results, the objective of the Ministry of the Research & Development scheme cannot be achieved. The Committee also feels that the existing allocation of the Ministry for Research & Development is not sufficient and that share of Research & Development from the plan allocation of the Ministry needs to be increased substantially. The Committee therefore, recommends that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change should pay due attention towards achieving its targets in Research & Development and adequate budgetary increase should be made in the allocations of the Ministry at R.E. stage for making additional provisions for Research & Development.

ASSISTANCE FOR ABATEMENT OF POLLUTION

9.1 The scheme of Assistance for Abatement of Pollution was conceptualized in 1992 with the objective inter alia to strengthen the Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB) and State Pollution Control Boards/ Pollution Control Committees (SPCBs/PCCs) for enforcing statutory provisions for pollution abatement. The scheme is a part of a centrally sponsored umbrella scheme of 'Pollution Abatement'. The scheme had an allocation of ₹ 60.00 crore in the 12th Five Year Plan. Under this scheme, grants are provided to the State Pollution Control Boards/UT Pollution Control Committees, Environment Departments of States/UTs, Central/State Research Institutes and other government agencies/organizations with the aim of strengthening their technical capabilities to achieve the objectives of the Policy Statement. Assistance is also provided to North Eastern Pollution Control Boards & Pollution Control Committees as salary support for the technical staff. In addition, support is also extended for undertaking projects for Abatement of Pollution.

9.2 The physical performance of the scheme during the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 is as under:-

Year	Objectives/ Outcomes	Physical Targets	Achieve- ment
2014-15	Providing Grants-in-Aid to CPCB for fulfilling its objectives under the Water Act, 1974, Air Act, 1981, and EPA 1986	Operating Water Quality Monitoring Stations: 2,500	2500
		Ambient Air Quality Monitoring Stations: 700	244
		New Noise Monitoring Stations: 35	In process
		Operating Water Quality Monitoring Stations: 2,500	Under Process
2015-16		Ambient Air Quality Monitoring Stations: 580	
		New Noise Monitoring Stations: 70	

9.3 The Committee was also informed that an amount of ₹ 1.51 crore had been spent upto 31st December, 2015 out of the total R.E. allocation of ₹ 4.32 crore for this programme during 2015-16.

9.4 The Committee is of the view that pollution, whether it be air, water or noise, has gone beyond permissible limits during the last few years and has serious consequences for the health

and well being of the citizens of the country. However, the Committee finds that the performance of the Ministry/Central Pollution Control Board in a scheme relating to providing assistance for abatement of pollution is not impressive at all. The Ministry could not achieve the physical targets relating to Ambient Air Quality Monitoring Stations and New Noise Monitoring Stations while other targets set have been stated to be under process. Further, the Ministry could utilise only nearly 35% of the allocation upto December, 2015, which too reflects very poorly on the performance under this scheme. At a time when the Ministry is required to address the grave and critical challenge of deteriorating air and water quality and increasing noise pollution, the Ministry has not been able to fully utilise the allocations made for a scheme providing assistance for abatement of pollution. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry should take a serious note of its performance under this scheme and take all necessary measures to ensure that the targets under the scheme are achieved in future and funds allocated are optimally utilised.

NATIONAL ACTION PLAN ON CLIMATE CHANGE

10.1 The Committee was informed that the Ministry is involved in formulating India's climate change policies in line with National Action Plan on Climate Change (NAPCC). 'Climate Change Action Programme (CCAP) was approved by the Cabinet in January 2013 for implementation in the 12th Five Year Plan as a Central Scheme with full funding from central budget. The total provision for the scheme is ₹ 290.00 crore.

10.2 Climate Change Action Plan scheme comprises of eight activities namely, Coordination of National Action Plan on Climate Change (NAPCC), State Action Plan on Climate Change (SAPCC), National Institute for Climate Change Studies and Actions (NICCSA), National Carbonaceous Aerosols Programme (NCAP), Long Term Ecological Observatories (LTEO) for Climate Change Studies, Coordinated Studies on Climate Change for North East Region (CSCCNER), International negotiations and contributions and Capacity Building.

10.3 The Committee was also informed that the Government has established the National Adaptation Fund on Climate Change (NAFCC) with a budget provision of ₹ 350 crores for the year 2015-16 and 2016-17. The objective of the fund is to assist State and Union Territories that are particularly vulnerable to the adverse effects of climate change in meeting the cost of adaptation. The National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development (NABARD) has been appointed as National Implementing Entity (NIE) responsible for implementation of adaptation projects under the NAFCC. The focus of the fund is to assist adaptation projects and programmes to support concrete adaptation activities that reduce the effects of climate change facing communities and sectors.

10.4 The actual expenditure 2014-15, R.E. 2015-16 and actual expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015) under the scheme are as under:-

Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
3.91	0.00	136.79	0.00	14.53	0.00

10.5 The Committee is dismayed to note that the Ministry had utilised only 14.53 crore for the programme in 2015-16 (upto 31st December, 2015) out of the allocated B.E. sum of ₹ 136.79 crore, which is only 11% of the funds allocated the year 2015-16. The Committee had in its 254th Report also highlighted the gross underutilisation of funds under this scheme during the years 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. The performance of the Ministry in 2015-16 has been no better. The Committee is at a loss to understand as to how a Ministry which is not even able to make use of a fraction of the funds made available for Climate Change Action Programme, would undertake additional interventions in the requisite areas of the Programme. A glance at the allocations made and expenditure incurred under the programme during the last few years indicates that the Ministry does not require huge funds for the programme. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change should make a realistic assessment of the funds required for the programme and seek allocations accordingly so that the allocations made are not underutilized in successive years.

BIOSPHERE RESERVES

11.1 The Scheme on Biosphere Reserves (BRs) was initiated in 1986 for *in-situ* conservation of representative ecosystems of major bio geographic zones of the country having global importance. Sustainable development, protection research, monitoring, education, training and information exchange are its major components. Assistance is provided for approved activities/ interventions in Biosphere Reserves. Research projects are also supported to monitor and understand changes in structure and functioning of 18 BRs designated so far. The scheme has the following objectives:

- (i) Conservation of representative and unique ecosystems and landscapes, species and genetic variations.
- (ii) Encourage culturally, socially and ecologically sustainable development.
- (iii) Provide support for research, monitoring, education, training and information exchange.

11.2 At national level, Indian National Man and Biosphere (MAB) Committee has been constituted to advise on policy and programme formulation and BRs, lay down guidelines for the preparation of Management Action Plans (MAPs) including monitoring and evaluation and designation of new BRs. The main components of MAPs are management interventions in buffer and transition zones, including alternate livelihood options, restoration of degraded habitats and research in priority areas based on identified problems, which are funded under the Scheme so as to provide inputs for management of these ecosystems on sound ecological principles. Stakeholders' consultations, workshop-cum-training of BR managers and recommendation of financial assistance for research proposals to suggest research-based inputs in implementation of MAPs are organised by Indian National MAB Committee. Implementation of MAPs is carried out by States concerned mostly through the Forest Department. Monitoring of the Scheme is carried out by the Steering Committee at State Level.

11.3 The following are the major recent developments under the scheme:-

- i) 07 BRs [Sunderban (West Bengal), Gulf of Mannar (Tamil Nadu), Nilgiri (tri-junction of Tamil Nadu, Kerala and Karnataka), Nanda Devi (Uttarakhand), Nokrek (Meghalaya), Panchmarhi (Madhya Pradesh) and Similipal (Odisha)] have been included in the World Network of Biosphere Reserves (WNBR) of UNESCO.

- ii) Guidelines for the Scheme initiated in Eleventh Plan are being suitably updated.
- iii) Following 03 landscapes were designated Biosphere Reserves:-
 - Cold Desert (Himachal Pradesh - 7,770 km²) — 28.08.2009
 - Seshasachalam (Andhra Pradesh - 4,755.99 km²) — 20.09.2010
 - Panna (Madhya Pradesh - 2,998.98 km²) — 25.08.2011
- iv) Area of Khangchendzonga (Sikkim) Biosphere Reserve was increased to 2,931.12 km² on core and buffer zones of Biosphere Reserves.

11.4 The financial performance of the Ministry under this scheme is as under:-

(₹ in Crore)					
Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
8.06	0.00	7.53	0.00	3.91	0.00

11.5 The Committee notes that the Ministry was able to utilise only around 50% of its annual allocation upto December, 2015, which shows a very casual approach of the Ministry towards *in-situ* conservation of representative ecosystems of major bio-geographic zones of the country having global importance. The Committee recommends that the Ministry should undertake a review of the schedule of activities under the scheme and plan its activities in a manner that there is no underutilisation of funds.

MONITORING MECHANISM OF THE MINISTRY

12.1 Having observed that the achievements of the Ministry in many of the schemes was way off the targets set and there had been underutilisation of the funds allocated for the schemes, the Committee desired to know from the Ministry as to what mechanism has been devised by it to monitor and review the progress of its ongoing schemes/programmes and the details of monitoring/review undertaken during the last year and the results thereof.

The Ministry informed the Committee as under:-

- (i) To ensure proper and effective utilization of funds, the schemes/projects of the Ministry are being monitored regularly, both at Central level as well as field level.
- (ii) Monitoring process, *inter alia*, includes mandatory audit of accounts of grantee organization, submission of audited utilization certificates, expenditure statement and a progress report on the activities conducted by the grantee organization besides field visits by Officers of the Ministry.
- (iii) A mechanism of Nodal Officers has been established, under which each State/UT has been assigned a senior Officer as its Nodal Officer for regular interaction with them.
- (iv) While NRCD has a detailed MIS system for monitoring in place, research projects are monitored/reviewed by the concerned Expert Review Committees.

- (v) As part of Pollution Control, Installation of online effluent and emission monitoring in polluting industry and data connectivity with State Pollution Control Board (SPCB)/CPCB is a step towards self-monitoring and transparency.
- (vi) The Centrally Sponsored Schemes in the Forestry & Wildlife sector have streamlined their implementation mechanism and release of funds to enable faster disbursement of funds to the States.
- (vii) The Public Finance Management System (PFMS) portal administered by the Controller General of Accounts, Department of Expenditure and running in the Pay & Accounts Offices under the Ministry for the past few years was expanded in November, 2015 to include payments in respect of Non-Plan expenditure. The portal provides for real time reporting of expenditure at all levels of Program implementation through bank interface, timely MIS and reconciliation of Government accounts.
- (viii) The expanded scope of PFMS will further enable transparency in payments, online monitoring of expenditure and speedy preparation of Government accounts. Regular meetings are held with the Divisional Heads in charge of the Programmes/Schemes to expedite utilization levels. Instructions have been issued to the Programme Divisions/autonomous bodies/ attached offices from time to time to improve the pace of utilization.
- (ix) The adoption of e-Governance has also aided in good management and regulation of environmental resources.

12.2 The Committee is of the view that a strong and potent monitoring mechanism is extremely important for achieving the set objectives and implementation of the schemes. The Committee takes note of the monitoring mechanism in place in the Ministry. However, as brought out in the preceding paragraphs, the monitoring mechanism failed to ensure proper and effective utilisation of funds. Not only the funds allocated have been grossly under-utilised but there has also been a shortfall in the achievements of the Ministry with respect to the targets set under various schemes, which also results in delay in the implementation of schemes as well as time and cost over-runs. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry should undertake a review of its administrative and monitoring mechanism and strengthen the same to ensure that funds allocated for important schemes/programmes are not underutilised and objectives of the schemes are achieved.

WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT

13. Like forests, wildlife is also a national resource which not only helps in maintaining the ecological balance but is also beneficial from economic, recre-ational and aesthetic points of view. Wildlife management deals with protecting endangered and threatened species and subspecies and their habitats, as well as the non-threatened agricultural animals and game species. The details of the programme under Wildlife Management are as under:-

- (a) Project Tiger

13.1 India launched the holistic “Project Tiger” in 1973 to conserve our critically endangered national animal - the tiger. Based on the recommendations of the Tiger Task Force, the Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972 was amended in 2006 for creating the National Tiger Conservation Authority (NTCA) to give statutory

support for strengthening tiger conservation. The coverage of “Project Tiger” has increased from 9 reserves since inception to 48 tiger reserves spread out in 18 States of the country in 2015. Though the focus is on the flagship / umbrella species ‘tiger’ the project strives to maintain the stability of ecosystem by fostering other tropic levels in the food chain thereby ensuring healthy forests, clean air, clean water and a clean environment. NTCA retains oversight through advisories / normative guidelines, based on appraisal of tiger status, ongoing conservation initiatives and recommendations of specially constituted Committees. All India Tiger Estimation, 2014 results shows that India now has 2226 tigers which are 30% increase over the last count and is 70% of the total global tiger population.

(b) Project Elephant

13.2 Project Elephant was launched in 1991-92 as a Centrally Sponsored Scheme with following objectives:

- (i) To protect elephants, their habitat and corridors;
- (ii) To address issues of man-animal conflict; and
- (iii) Welfare of domesticated elephant.

13.3 The Committee was informed that financial and technical assistance is being provided to major elephant bearing States in the country. Under the scheme, 100% financial assistance is provided to the concerned State Government for undertaking various activities for scientific management of elephant habitats. Presently, the project is being implemented in 22 States / UTs. There are 29 notified and 3 proposed Elephant Reserves in the country, which are still to be notified by the concerned State Governments, covering approximately 65,000 sq. km. area.

(c) Strengthening of Wildlife Division

13.4 The scheme was started in 1986 for supporting activities like strengthening of Central Wildlife Division and Regional Offices and development of infrastructure for better enforcement of Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972, CITES, etc. During 2006, with the amendment to the Wildlife (Protection) Act, Wildlife Crime Control Bureau (WCCB), a multi-disciplinary organisation with officials from forests, police and customs was constituted. The Regional Offices of Wildlife Preservation were made part of the Bureau, which is headquartered at Delhi. The details of physical performance under the scheme during 2014-15 and 2015-16 are as under:-

Year	Objectives/ Outcomes	Targets	Achievements
2014-15	(i) To strengthen and administer the Wildlife organization in the Ministry;	Quantitative targets are not assigned under this scheme. However, it is envisaged that scheme shall support 5 new research projects and ongoing project during this year.	4 ongoing research projects supported.
	(ii) To strengthen the functioning of the offices of the Wildlife Crime Control Bureau and its Regional and Sub-Regional Offices for the enforcement of	Wildlife Crime Control Bureau will conduct 20 training courses for capacity building for SWCEA, and 40 Sensitization programme for	Wildlife crime control bureau 15 training courses for capacity building for SWCEA 29, Sensitization programme for Panchayat Raj Institutions

Year	Objectives/ Outcomes	Targets	Achievements
	Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972 & CITES;	Panchayati Raj Institutions.	
2015-16	(iii) To provide consultancies for special tasks & assistance to research programmes;	Enforcement of Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972 and provisions under CITES. The scheme shall support:	
	(iv) To provide Rajiv Gandhi & Amrita Devi Bishnoi Awards.	(i) 5 new Research Projects and ongoing Research projects.	(i) One new research project and 3 ongoing projects
	(v) To provide Dr. Salim Ali & Dr. Kailash Sankhla National Fellowships.	(ii) 12 inter-Agency Coordination meetings to discuss issues pertaining to combat organized wildlife crime. (iii) conduct 24 capacity building training courses for State Wildlife Crime Enforcement Agencies. (iv) 42 Sensitization/ education programmes for Panchayati Raj Institutions and 60 Sensitization Workshops for for various Central & State Agencies	(ii) 07 Inter – agency coordination meetings to discuss issues related to combat organized wildlife crime (iii) 15 capacity building courses for State Wildlife Crime Enforcement agencies (iv) 35 sensitization programs for PRIs, and 46 sensitization workshops for various central and State agencies.

13.5 The financial details of 2014-15 and 2015-16 are as under:-

<i>(₹ in Crore)</i>					
Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
Central Zoo Authority					
29.50	0.00	12.00	0.00	9.37	0.00
National Zoological Park, Delhi					
5.48	13.51	1.50	15.50	0.00	7.95
Control of Wildlife Crime					
5.44	0.00	6.47	0.00	4.15	0.00

INTEGRATED DEVELOPMENT OF WILDLIFE HABITATS

13.6 A comprehensive CSS scheme 'Integrated Development of Wildlife Habitats' was envisaged in December, 2008 to provide for a broad spectrum of conservation interventions in the field by adding more components and activities to the extant CSS titled 'Assistance for the Development of National Parks and Sanctuaries'. The Protected Area (PA) network in India comprises 670 PAs (102 National Parks, 515 Wildlife Sanctuaries, 47 Conservation Reserves and 4 Community Reserves), which is supported. The modified Scheme has following components: 'Protection of Wildlife outside Protected Areas' and 'Recovery Programmes for Critically Endangered Species'.

13.7 For supporting wildlife and natural resources lying outside PAs, high-value biodiversity areas outside Protected Areas and areas contiguous to Protected Areas/corridors are given priority. Chief Wildlife Wardens prepare a Biodiversity Conservation Plan for such selected areas. The Scheme supports various activities aimed at conservations of wildlife that *inter alia* include habitat improvement practices, infrastructure development, eco-development, anti-poaching activities, research, training, capacity building, census of wildlife etc.

13.8 The Committee was informed that many important wildlife habitats exist outside Protected Areas which also require special attention for conservation. In this Plan period so far, financial assistance could not be provided to them due to non-availability of funds. Human-animal conflict is a factor which has been a matter of concern for a smooth conservation effort for wildlife. An added impetus is prepared for dealing with human-animal conflict management in and around forest areas for which funds are also required for awareness, organizing, conflict management activities, relief for depredation related damages and losses and at times captive and handling for relocation/population control of animals etc.

13.9 The financial details in respect of the scheme are as under:-

(₹ in Crore)					
Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
84.40	0.00	61.21	0.79	52.43	0.00

13.10 **The Committee notes the performance of the Ministry in various schemes under Wildlife Management. As regards Project Elephant, the Committee recommends that the Ministry should, on priority, take up the matter relating to the notification of the 3 proposed Elephant Reserves in the country with the concerned State Governments, to achieve the objectives of the scheme. The under-performance of the Ministry with respect to targets *vis-à-vis* achievements in 'Strengthening of Wildlife Division' scheme in 2015-16 is quite evident. Further, National Zoological Park, Delhi failed to utilise even a penny of its allocated plan budget in 2015-16. The Committee recommends that the Ministry needs to seriously look into all these issues to improve the physical and financial performance in these programmes.**

13.11 **As regards Integrated Development of Wildlife Habitats, the Committee is constrained to note that financial assistance could not be provided to important wildlife habitats which exist outside Protected Areas, due to paucity of funds. The Committee is of the view that wildlife**

habitats which exist outside Protected Areas also require special attention for conservation. The Committee, therefore, recommends that non-availability of funds should not be allowed to come in the way of wildlife habitats outside Protected Areas and that adequate budgetary allocation should be made to the Ministry for this purpose in financial year 2016-17.

NATIONAL RIVER CONSERVATION PLAN - NATIONAL RIVER CONSERVATION DIRECTORATE (NCRD)

14.1 The Ministry informed the Committee that NCRD administers the National Lake Conservation Plan (NLCP) and National Wetlands Conservation Programme (NWCP) which have been into the new CSS 'National Plan for Conservation of Aquatic Eco-system (NPCA). As per amendment to the Government of India (Allocation of Business) Rules, 1961 dated 31st July, 2014, the work relating to Ganga and its tributaries have been transferred to the Ministry of Water Resources, River Development and Ganga Rejuvenation (MoWR, RD & GR).

14.2 The Committee was further informed that the main objective of the NRCP is to supplement the efforts of the State Governments for improving the water quality of polluted stretches of rivers by preventing the pollution loads reaching the rivers by undertaking various pollution abatement works. The works include (i) interception and diversion / sewerage works to capture the raw sewage flowing into the rivers and divert them for treatment, (ii) sewage treatment plant for treating the diverted sewage, (iii) low cost sanitation works to prevent open defecation on river banks, (iv) electric and improved wood based crematoria to conserve the use of wood and help in ensuring proper cremation of bodies brought to the burning ghats, (v) river front development such as improvement of bathing at ghats and (vi) other minor miscellaneous works.

14.3 The Committee observed that against the target of creation of 117 mld of Sewage Treatment Capacity in 2015-16, only 77 mld STP capacity had been created during the year. The Ministry informed that the balance treatment capacity of 50 mld cannot be created in 2015-16 due to non-availability of adequate / required budget provision under NRCP during the year.

14.4 The financial details of in respect of NCRP are as under:-

<i>(₹ in Crore)</i>		
Actual Expenditure 2014-15	Revised Estimate 2015-16	Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)
Plan	Plan	Plan
	NCRD	
6.11	7.00	4.70
	NRCP	
77.59	66.73	37.35

14.5 The Committee finds that more and more rivers and water bodies are getting polluted and the level of their pollution is increasing day-by-day. In such a scenario, not allocating the required funds even for the ongoing works shows a self-defeating approach. The Committee notes that the Ministry utilised only ₹ 37.35 crore out of the allocated ₹ 66.73 crore upto December, 2015 during 2015-16. On the one hand, the Ministry complains of not having been provided adequate

funds for the programme and on the other, it is able to expend only nearly 56% of the allocation made. The Committee, while recommending that adequate budgetary provisions should be provided to the Ministry for National River Conservation Plan during the year 2016-17, advises the Ministry to ensure that the funds are utilised optimally and the targets are met under the scheme.

NATIONAL NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM

15.1 The scheme National Natural Resources Management System (NNRMS) is part of an umbrella scheme of the Planning Commission i.e. Planning Committee - National Natural Resources Management System (PC-NNRMS). The main objective of PC-NNRMS is utilisation of remote sensing technology for inventorisation, assessment and monitoring of country's natural resources.

15.2 The Committee was informed that some major projects sponsored under this scheme are as under:-

- (i) Forest Type Mapping on 1:50,000 scale of entire country, coordinated by FSI.
- (ii) Mapping of Wildlife Sanctuaries and National Parks on 1:25,000 scale, coordinated by WII.
- (iii) Coastal Studies (Land use, Mangroves, Coral Reefs etc.) for Indian Coast (1:25,000 scale).
- (iv) Snow and Glaciers Mapping of entire Himalayas (1:2,50,000/50,000 scale), SAC (ISRO).
- (v) National Wetland Inventory and Assessment (1:50,000 scale), coordinated by SAC (ISRO).

15.3 Further, National Wetland Information System and National Coastal Zone Information System developed in GIS Platform is being extensively used to implement wetland and CRZ notifications. The targets and achievements during 2014-15 and 2015-16 are as under:-

Year	Objectives/ Outcomes	Targets	Achievements
2014-15	Examine and identify key issues in management of Bio-Resources and Environment	Launching of Six new projects	03
		Servicing on-going projects-25	20
2015-16		Launching of Six new projects	03
		Support to ongoing 20 projects	8 projects

15.4 The financial details with respect to the scheme are as under:-

<i>(₹ in Crore)</i>					
Actual Expenditure 2014-15		Revised Estimate 2015-16		Expenditure 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015)	
Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan	Plan	Non-Plan
2.77	0.00	3.36	0.00	1.78	0.00

15.5 The Committee expresses its displeasure that the performance of the Ministry under this scheme with respect to targets *vis-a-vis* achievements is highly unsatisfactory. The Ministry failed to achieve any of the 4 targets under this scheme in 2014-15 and 2015-16. The performance in terms of utilising the allocations is also not upto the mark since the Ministry could utilise only

52.38 percent of the allocation till December, 2015. The Committee is of the view that remote sensing technology plays a very important role in assessment and monitoring of country's natural resources. The Committee recommends that the Ministry should make all possible efforts to ensure that the allocations made therefor are utilised fully.

GENERAL OBSERVATION

16. Pollution prevention is a major global concern because of its harmful effects on people's health and the overall environment. Air Pollution has assumed gigantic proportions in our country. Growing urbanization, rapid industrialization and increasing population etc. during the last few years have also tremendously impacted the environmental concerns of the country. In such a scenario, the measures taken by Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change for prevention and control of pollution and maintaining ecological balance have not been commensurate with the magnitude of the problem. The budgetary allocations of the Ministry are considerably low compared to the projections made by the Ministry for the 12th Plan period. However, the Ministry is not even able to fully utilize the funds which are made available to it and also falls short of achieving the physical targets set or otherwise. The Committee is of the view that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change needs to be adequately funded for taking all necessary steps in pursuit of the discharge of its mandate, which includes ensuring better environment management and preservation of biodiversity including wildlife. In view of the foregoing, the Committee recommends that the Ministry, on its part, must prepare a long term plan, put forth futuristic projections and ensure that the allocated outlays are fully utilized and targets achieved.

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS — AT A GLANCE

RATIONALIZATION OF PLAN SCHEMES

The Committee takes note of the rationalisation and merger of some schemes in the budget allocation of the Department and hopes that the merger of the schemes will provide the required flexibility to the Ministry for the implementation of the schemes. (Para 2.5)

FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE OF THE DEPARTMENT

The Committee observes that against the approved outlay of ₹ 17,874 crore, the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change was allocated only ₹ 8459.60 crore during the first four years of the 12th Plan and the same was reduced to ₹ 6893.69 crore at R. E. Stage. In 2016-17, allocation of ₹ 2000.00 crore has been made to the Department, raising the actual total allocation of the Department to ₹ 10459.60 crore, which is only 58.51 percent of the allocated approved for the 12th Five Year Plan. The Ministry was able to spend only 67.33% 74.54% and 74.56% of the B.E. allocation during 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15 respectively and 84.45% of the B.E. allocation upto February, 2016 in 2015-16. (Para 3.2)

The Committee is of the view that the very purpose of formulation of schemes/programme during the Five Year Plans is defeated if adequate financial allocations are not made for them in time. It also has an adverse bearing on the execution of these projects. The Committee is disappointed to note that instead of being provided the approved allocation, the Ministry has been provided only 58.51 percent of its approved outlay, thereby adversely affecting the schemes/programmes of the Ministry in the 12th Five Year Plan. (Para 3.4)

The Committee observes that although the actual utilisation of the allocated funds of the Ministry has been steadily increasing during the last few years, the performance of the Department in terms of utilisation of funds leaves much to be desired. The Ministry could utilise only 84.45 percent of the allocation upto February, 2016. Most of the reasons cited by the Ministry for under-utilisation of funds are administrative and procedural which could have been avoided. This also shows lack of planning and foresightedness on part of the Ministry. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry should undertake a review of its financial performance during the last few years and try to identify the bottlenecks responsible for not being able to optimally utilise the funds at its disposal so as to improve its performance on this front in the future. (Para 3.5)

BUDGET ALLOCATION OF THE YEAR 2016-17

The mandate of the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change is to ensure better environment management and preservation of biodiversity including Wildlife. Although the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change has been allocated 18.1 % more funds compared to the allocation made in R.E. 2015-16, the Committee is of the view that allocations are not sufficient for the Ministry to effectively discharge its functions. In view of the importance of the task mandated to the Ministry which has all the more relevance in the day-today life of all of us and our surroundings, the Committee recommends that the budgetary allocation of the

Ministry should be suitably enhanced at R.E. stage to enable the Ministry to discharge its mandate effectively. (Para 4.3)

FOREST SURVEY OF INDIA

The Committee notes that although the Forest Survey of India was able to expend nearly 70% of the allocation made upto December, 2015, there is a visible gap in its targets and achievements in the year 2015-16 in terms of Inventory of Forests (Urban and Research). Inventory of Forests is one of the major activities of Forest Survey of India and it failed to achieve its targets in this field. The Committee recommends that Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change and Forest Survey of India should seriously consider the matter and take all necessary measures to ensure that such shortfalls do not recur in future. (Para 6.4)

ZOOLOGICAL SURVEY OF INDIA (ZSI)

The Committee observes that Zoological Survey of India was not able to achieve its targets in terms of field surveys, Digitisation of National Zoological Specimen, documentation of species of identified animals, training programme etc. The Zoological Survey of India could also spend only nearly 64% of the plan allocation during 2015-16 (upto 31.12.2015). The performance of Zoological Survey of India in terms of both achievements of targets and utilisation of funds, therefore, is not satisfactory and accordingly, the Committee recommends that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change must take urgent remedial measures to ensure that the performance of Zoological Survey of India improves on both these fronts and the allocations made are not underutilised. (Para 7.4)

RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

The Committee is dismayed to note the big lag between the targets and achievements of the Ministry in the Research and Development sector in all parameters during 2014-15 and 2015-16. The performance in 2015-16 has also been sharp decline compared to the performance in 2014-15. Facilitating research and development and investing for the same are extremely important for the development of any nation and for a developing country like India, the critical importance of Research and Development cannot be overemphasized. The Committee is of the opinion that without the desired results, the objective of the Ministry of the Research & Development scheme cannot be achieved. The Committee also feels that the existing allocation of the Ministry for Research & Development is not sufficient and that share of Research & Development from the plan allocation of the Ministry needs to be increased substantially. The Committee therefore, recommends that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change should pay due attention towards achieving its targets in Research & Development and adequate budgetary increase should be made in the allocations of the Ministry at R.E. stage for making additional provisions for Research & Development. (Para 8.5)

ASSISTANCE FOR ABATEMENT OF POLLUTION

The Committee is of the view that pollution, whether it be air, water or noise, has gone beyond permissible limits during the last few years and has serious consequences for the health and well being of the citizens of the country. However, the Committee finds that the performance of the Ministry/Central Pollution Control Board in a scheme relating to providing assistance for

abatement of pollution is not impressive at all. The Ministry could not achieve the physical targets relating to Ambient Air Quality Monitoring Stations and New Noise Monitoring Stations while other targets set have been stated to be under process. Further, the Ministry could utilise only nearly 35% of the allocation upto December, 2015, which too reflects very poorly on the performance under this scheme. At a time when the Ministry is required to address the grave and critical challenge of deteriorating air and water quality and increasing noise pollution, the Ministry has not been able to fully utilise the allocations made for a scheme providing assistance for abatement of pollution. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry should take a serious note of its performance under this scheme and take all necessary measures to ensure that the targets under the scheme are achieved in future and funds allocated are optimally utilised. (Para 9.4)

NATIONAL ACTION PLAN ON CLIMATE CHANGE

The Committee is dismayed to note that the Ministry had utilised only 14.53 crore for the programme in 2015-16 (upto 31st December, 2015) out of the allocated B.E. sum of ₹ 136.79 crore, which is only 11% of the funds allocated the year 2015-16. The Committee had in its 254th Report also highlighted the gross underutilisation of funds under this scheme during the years 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. The performance of the Ministry in 2015-16 has been no better. The Committee is at a loss to understand as to how a Ministry which is not even able to make use of a fraction of the funds made available for Climate Change Action Programme, would undertake additional interventions in the requisite areas of the Programme. A glance at the allocations made and expenditure incurred under the programme during the last few years indicates that the Ministry does not require huge funds for the programme. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change should make a realistic assessment of the funds required for the programme and seek allocations accordingly so that the allocations made are not underutilized in successive years. (Para 10.5)

BIOSPHERE RESERVES

The Committee notes that the Ministry was able to utilise only around 50% of its annual allocation upto December, 2015, which shows a very casual approach of the Ministry towards *in-situ* conservation of representative ecosystems of major bio-geographic zones of the country having global importance. The Committee recommends that the Ministry should undertake a review of the schedule of activities under the scheme and plan its activities in a manner that there is no underutilisation of funds. (Para 11.5)

MONITORING MECHANISM OF THE MINISTRY

The Committee is of the view that a strong and potent monitoring mechanism is extremely important for achieving the set objectives and implementation of the schemes. The Committee takes note of the monitoring mechanism in place in the Ministry. However, as brought out in the preceding paragraphs, the monitoring mechanism failed to ensure proper and effective utilisation of funds. Not only the funds allocated have been grossly under-utilised but there has also been a shortfall in the achievements of the Ministry with respect to the targets set under various schemes, which also results in delay in the implementation of schemes as well as time and cost over-runs. The Committee, therefore, recommends that the Ministry should undertake a review of its

administrative and monitoring mechanism and strengthen the same to ensure that funds allocated for important schemes/programmes are not underutilised and objectives of the schemes are achieved. (Para 12.2)

WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT

The Committee notes the performance of the Ministry in various schemes under Wildlife Management. As regards Project Elephant, the Committee recommends that the Ministry should, on priority, take up the matter relating to the notification of the 3 proposed Elephant Reserves in the country with the concerned State Governments, to achieve the objectives of the scheme. The under-performance of the Ministry with respect to targets *vis-à-vis* achievements in ‘Strengthening of Wildlife Division’ scheme in 2015-16 is quite evident. Further, National Zoological Park, Delhi failed to utilise even a penny of its allocated plan budget in 2015-16. The Committee recommends that the Ministry needs to seriously look into all these issues to improve the physical and financial performance in these programmes. (Para 13.10)

As regards Integrated Development of Wildlife Habitats, the Committee is constrained to note that financial assistance could not be provided to important wildlife habitats which exist outside Protected Areas, due to paucity of funds. The Committee is of the view that wildlife habitats which exist outside Protected Areas also require special attention for conservation. The Committee, therefore, recommends that non-availability of funds should not be allowed to come in the way of wildlife habitats outside Protected Areas and that adequate budgetary allocation should be made to the Ministry for this purpose in financial year 2016-17. (Para 13.11)

NATIONAL RIVER CONSERVATION PLAN - NATIONAL RIVER CONSERVATION DIRECTORATE (NCRD)

The Committee finds that more and more rivers and water bodies are getting polluted and the level of their pollution is increasing day-by-day. In such a scenario, not allocating the required funds even for the ongoing works shows a self-defeating approach. The Committee notes that the Ministry utilised only ₹ 37.35 crore out of the allocated ₹ 66.73 crore upto December, 2015 during 2015-16. On the one hand, the Ministry complains of not having been provided adequate funds for the programme and on the other, it is able to expend only nearly 56% of the allocation made. The Committee, while recommending that adequate budgetary provisions should be provided to the Ministry for National River Conservation Plan during the year 2016-17, advises the Ministry to ensure that the funds are utilised optimally and the targets are met under the scheme. (Para 14.5)

NATIONAL NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM

The Committee expresses its displeasure that the performance of the Ministry under this scheme with respect to targets *vis-a-vis* achievements is highly unsatisfactory. The Ministry failed to achieve any of the 4 targets under this scheme in 2014-15 and 2015-16. The performance in terms of utilising the allocations is also not upto the mark since the Ministry could utilise only 52.38 percent of the allocation till December, 2015. The Committee is of the view that remote sensing technology plays a very important role in assessment and monitoring of country’s natural resources. The Committee recommends that the Ministry should make all possible efforts to ensure that the allocations made therefor are utilised fully. (Para 15.5)

GENERAL OBSERVATION

Pollution prevention is a major global concern because of its harmful effects on people's health and the overall environment. Air Pollution has assumed gigantic proportions in our country. Growing urbanization, rapid industrialization and increasing population etc. during the last few years have also tremendously impacted the environmental concerns of the country. In such a scenario, the measures taken by Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change for prevention and control of pollution and maintaining ecological balance have not been commensurate with the magnitude of the problem. The budgetary allocations of the Ministry are considerably low compared to the projections made by the Ministry for the 12th Plan period. However, the Ministry is not even able to fully utilize the funds which are made available to it and also falls short of achieving the physical targets set or otherwise. The Committee is of the view that the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change needs to be adequately funded for taking all necessary steps in pursuit of the discharge of its mandate, which includes ensuring better environment management and preservation of biodiversity including wildlife. In view of the foregoing, the Committee recommends that the Ministry, on its part, must prepare a long term plan, put forth futuristic projections and ensure that the allocated outlays are fully utilized and targets achieved.

(Para 16)

MINUTES

XI
ELEVENTH MEETING

The Committee met at 11.00 A.M. on Monday, the 30th March, 2016 in Committee Room 'A', Ground Floor, Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

MEMBERS PRESENT

1. Shri Ashwani Kumar — *Chairman*

RAJYA SABHA

2. Shri Prem Chand Gupta
3. Shri Arvind Kumar Singh
4. Shri Bhupinder Singh

LOK SABHA

5. Shri Prabhatsinh Chauhan
6. Shri Pankaj Chowdhary
7. Shri Ninong Ering
8. Shri Laxman Giluwa
9. Shri Daddan Mishra
10. Shri Nana Patole
11. Shri Nagendra Kumar Pradhan
12. Shri Harinarayan Rajbhar
13. Shri Kirti Vardhan Singh
14. Shri Nagendra Singh
15. Shri Vikram Usendi
16. Shrimati Vasanthi M.

SECRETARIAT

Shri M.K. Khan, *Joint Secretary*

Shri Rohtas, *Director*

Shri Mohd. Salamuddin, *Deputy Director*

Shri Rajiv Saxena, *Assistant Director*

2.	*	*	*
3.	*	*	*
4.	*	*	*
5.	*	*	*
6.	*	*	*

*** Relate to other matters.

7. * * *
8. * * *

9. The Committee reassembled at 2.10 p.m. and the following representatives of Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change appeared before the Committee:

1. Shri Ashok Lavasa, Secretary
2. Dr. Sharad Singh Negi, Director General (Forest) & Special Secretary
3. Shri H.K. Pande, Special Secretary
4. Shri Susheel Kumar, Special Secretary
5. Shri P.K. Dash, Additional Secretary and Financial Adviser
6. Dr. Anandi Subramaniam, Senior Adviser
7. Shri Vinod Ranjan, Additional Director General (Wild Life)
8. Shri Anil Kumar, Additional Director General, Forest Conservation
9. Shri B.S. Bonal, Additional Director General, National Tiger Conservation Authority
10. Shri M.M. Kutty, Additional Secretary
11. Shri Anil Sant, Joint Secretary
12. Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad, Joint Secretary
13. Shri Manoj Kumar Singh, Joint Secretary
14. Shri Bishwanath Sinha, Joint Secretary
15. Shri Arun Kumar Mehta, Joint Secretary
16. Shri Anoop Bhadwa, IFG (NEAB)
17. Ms. Rekha Pai, IFG (EAP)
18. Shri S.K. Khanduri, IGF, Wild Life
19. Shri R.K. Srivastva, IGF (PE)
20. Shri Deepak Kumar Sinha, IGF, Forest Conservation
21. Dr. A.B. Hrapanahalli, Advisor
22. Dr. Rashid Hasan, Advisor
23. Shri J. R. Bhatt, Advisor
24. Shri B. Sikka, Advisor
25. Shri M. Peter Johnson, Statistical Advisor

26. Dr. Ashwani Kumar, Director General, Indian Council of Forest Research and Education
27. Shri B.B. Mathur, Director, Wildlife Institute of India
28. Shri Vinod Kumar, Director, Indira Gandhi National Forest Academy
29. Dr. Anmol Kumar, Director, Forest Survey of India
30. Dr. A.B. Akolkar, Member Secretary, Central Pollution Control Board

10. At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the Members of the Committee; Secretary, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change and his team of officers and informed that the Committee was scheduled to hear the Secretary on various aspects relating to Demand for Grants (2016-17) of the Ministry. Expressing his concern on the environmental degradation, ecological imbalance and rising pollution levels, he stressed the need for taking immediate and time-bound initiatives to address the challenges.

11. The Secretary, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change made a power point presentation dwelling on various aspects of the Budgetary allocation, the schemes implemented, achievements of the Ministry and procedural changes brought about for giving various types of environment and forest wildlife clearances. He also brought out that in 2015-16, the budgetary allocation of the Ministry was increased, unlike the previous years of the 12th Plan. The Secretary also pointed out that the Centre's share for the Centrally Sponsored schemes being implemented in the States had undergone a change and that they had reduced the number of umbrella schemes.

12. The Chairman of the Committee then referred to the study visit of the Committee to Goa in February, 2016 and stated that the Committee was intimated that coconut tree is defined as grass in Goa and desired to know its implications. He also raised the issue relating to illegal cutting of trees in Saranda forest in Jharkhand and desired to know the steps taken in the matter. Members of the Committee thereafter raised the issues relating to the allocations made under 'Green India Mission', dwindling forest cover in the country, immersion of industrial waste in the rivers, illegal cutting of trees and sand mining in the forest and monitoring of pollution level of the rivers etc. The Members also emphasized the need for greater use of technology to ensure effective monitoring and enforcement of the laws.

13. The, Secretary of the Ministry, while responding to the queries raised by the Members, stated that they had introduced a system of online monitoring for the highly polluting industries for pollution control and that they had been successful in persuading about 70% to 75% of the highly polluting industries to install the online pollution monitoring systems. He also informed about the use of satellites for mapping the tree cover, both within the forest and outside the forest. He also stated that Forest Research Institute had prepared a detailed project report regarding developing a plantation programme along the river Ganga and presented the same to Ministry of Water Resources, which was implementing the Ganga Rejuvenation Programme. As regards illegal cutting of trees and sand mining in the forest, the representatives of the Ministry brought out these activities were basically within the domain of the State Governments. The Ministry kept on pressing the State Governments and issuing advisories to take action against the defaulters and criminals engaged in such illegal activities. The Committee emphasized the need for an institutionalized mechanism between the Central and State Government authorities for the enforcement of the laws in this regard.

14. The Chairman then asked the Ministry to submit written replies to all the queries which could not be replied during the meeting to the Secretariat at the earliest.
15. The witnesses then withdrew.
16. A verbatim record of the proceeding was kept.
17. The meeting of the Committee adjourned at 4.21 P.M.

XV
FIFTEENTH MEETING

The Committee met at 3.00 P.M. on Thursday, the 5th May, 2016 in Room No. '139', First Floor, Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

MEMBERS PRESENT

1. Shrimati Renuka Chowdhury — *Chairperson*

RAJYA SABHA

2. Shri Bhupinder Singh

LOK SABHA

3. Shri Pankaj Chowdhary
4. Kum. Sushmita Dev
5. Shri Ninong Ering
6. Shri Laxman Giluwa
7. Shri Daddan Mishra
8. Shri Chirag Paswan .
9. Shri Nagendra Kumar Pradhan
10. Shri Nagendra Singh
11. Shri Vikram Usendi

SECRETARIAT

Shri M. K. Khan, *Joint Secretary*

Shri Mohd. Salamuddin, *Deputy Director*

Shri Rajiv Saxena, *Assistant Director*

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members to the meeting of the Committee. She informed the Members that the meeting had been convened to consider and adopt the draft 281st, 282nd, 283rd and 284th reports of the Committee on Demands for Grants (2016-17) of the Ministries/Departments of Science and Technology, Atomic Energy, Environment, Forest & Climate Change and Earth Sciences respectively.
3. The Committee, after considering the recommendations made In the draft reports, adopted the draft 281st, 282nd, 283rd and 284th reports with slight modifications. The Committee also decided to meet next on 6th May 2016 to consider and adopt some other draft reports.
4. The meeting of the Committee, then, adjourned at 4.15 P.M.