

**GOVERNMENT OF INDIA  
MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT  
DEPARTMENT OF SCHOOL EDUCATION & LITERACY**

**LOK SABHA  
STARRED QUESTION NO. 12  
TO BE ANSWERED ON 25<sup>th</sup> April, 2016**

**No-Detention Policy for Students**

**\*12. SHRI DHANANJAY MAHADIK:  
DR. NARAMALLI SIVA PRASAD:**

Will the **Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT** be pleased to state:

- (a) whether the Government has decided to revisit the no-detention policy in case of promotion of all students from classes V and VIII and if so, the details thereof and the reasons therefor;
- (b) whether the Government proposes to seek views of the State Governments and other stakeholders in this regard and if so, the details thereof;
- (c) whether the Government proposes to bring back the old system of compulsory board examinations for Tenth Class and if so, the details thereof;
- (d) whether the Government proposes to review Right to Education and to repeal no detention policy in the light of experience gained over the years and if so, the details thereof; and
- (e) whether the Government proposes to assess the impact of revision of No-Fail policy on the students and if so, the number of such students affected by the said policy, State and class-wise and the time by which the revised policy is likely to be implemented in the country?

**ANSWER**

**MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT  
(SMT. SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI)**

(a) to (e): A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

**STATEMENT REFERRED TO IN REPLY TO PARTS (a) TO (e) OF LOK SABHA STARRED QUESTION NO. 12 TO BE ANSWERED ON 25<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 ASKED BY SHRI DHANANJAY MAHADIK AND DR. NARAMALLI SIVA PRASAD REGARDING “NO-DETENTION POLICY FOR STUDENTS”.**

(a) & (b): In pursuance of a resolution adopted in the 59<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Central Advisory Board of Education (CABE) held on 6th June, 2012, a Sub-Committee was constituted for assessment of implementation of Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) in the context of No-Detention provision in the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education (RTE) Act, 2009. The Sub Committee during the course of its work held 5 (five) regional meetings and consulted various stakeholders over the issue of No Detention. The Sub-Committee submitted its report in August, 2014. The recommendations of Sub-Committee include, inter-alia, measuring Learning Level Outcomes of all children on regular basis, to catalyse a performance-driven culture and review of ‘No-Detention’ policy and its implementation in a phased manner.

The report of the Sub-Committee was placed before CABE in its meeting held on 19.8.2015, wherein it was decided to request all States/UTs to share their views on the No-Detention policy, with Ministry of Human Resource Development. 22 States shared their views on the No Detention policy out of which 18 States have suggested to modify the No Detention policy. The summary of the responses received from States is annexed.

Another Sub-Committee under the Chairpersonship of Minister of Education, Government of Rajasthan was constituted on 26.10.2015 inter-alia, to review the feedback received from States/UTs on the ‘No-Detention’ policy.

Additionally, during the consultations held with State Governments for formulation of New Education Policy (NEP), the issues related to No-Detention policy were also covered.

(c): There is no such proposal at present.

(d) & (e): The matter is under examination in this Ministry to develop a suitable academic approach on this issue.

\*\*\*\*\*

## Annexure

**ANNEXURE REFERRED TO IN REPLY TO PARTS (a) TO (b) OF LOK SABHA STARRED QUESTION NO. 12 TO BE ANSWERED ON 25<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 ASKED BY SHRI DHANANJAY MAHADIK AND DR. NARAMALLI SIVA PRASAD REGARDING “NO-DETENTION POLICY FOR STUDENTS”.**

| S. No. | Name of the State / UT | Date of receipt of letter of State Government/UT | Gist of Comments / Remarks of State Government / UTs  |
|--------|------------------------|--|---|
| 1.     | Bihar                  | 15.09.2015                                       | No Detention Policy to be withdrawn and Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) Policy should be implemented. Performance of students should be assessed from time to time.   |
| 2.     | Himachal Pradesh       | 28.09.2015                                       | 1. Introduction of internal examination at class 3 <sup>rd</sup> and third party examination at the level of 5 <sup>th</sup> and 8 <sup>th</sup> classes.<br>2. Detention of students at 3 <sup>rd</sup> , 5 <sup>th</sup> & 8 <sup>th</sup> classes who fail to acquire class appropriate competences as identified at the respective level.   |
| 3.     | Madhya Pradesh         | 21.09.2015                                       | Board examinations at classes 5 <sup>th</sup> & 8 <sup>th</sup> to be held because No Detention Policy has adverse impact on the academic performance of students..   |
| 4.     | Mizoram                | 15.09.2015                                       | All teachers to be trained in various aspect of Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) to enable them to practice it effectively. Till the system of CCE stabilizes, the No Detention Policy may be kept in abeyance for 5-7 yrs.  |
| 5.     | Odisha                 | 07.10.2015                                       | Provisions of 'No Detention' may be revisited and the State may be allowed to follow their own evaluation system at the end of every grade with class appropriate assessment.   |
| 6.     | Punjab                 | 06.08.2015                                       | Provisions of 'No Detention' may be amended to reintroduce exam system from 1 <sup>st</sup> – 8 <sup>th</sup> classes and start Board examination in classes 5 <sup>th</sup> & 8 <sup>th</sup> . A Resolution to this effect has been passed in the Punjab Vidhan Sabha.  |
| 7.     | Rajasthan              | 09.09.2015                                       | 'No Detention Policy' and 'Age appropriate Admission Policy' to be withdrawn due to the adverse impact in the quality of education on account of decline in the commitment levels of students as well as teachers towards education. Tests/examination and detention provide students a fair stage to perform, besides being a remedy for correcting the deficiency in the knowledge of students. |
| 8.     | Sikkim                 | 23.09.2015                                       | Roll out plan of "No detention" in phased manner and assessment at classes 5 <sup>th</sup> & 8 <sup>th</sup> as regular attendance is not ensured by the family and thus 'No Detention' has further aggravated the motivation of students and teachers.   |
| 9.     | Tripura                | 09.09.2015                                       | 'No Detention Policy' needs to be reviewed as this has led to a state of inattention to the teaching-learning process on the part of the children and has adverse impact on the regular attendance of students and teachers in schools.   |
| 10.    | Uttar Pradesh          | 30.9.2015  | 'No Detention Policy' needs to be revoked as it has   |

|     |                |            |  |
|-----|----------------|------------|--|
|     |                |            | resulted in lack of competition and has reduced the learning outcome of students.  |
| 11. | Uttarakhand    | 27.09.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' needs to be withdrawn as this has brought down the standard of education. Half-yearly and annual examinations should be conducted in order to improve the quality of education of students and also their competitive spirits. This would also increase the responsibility of teachers.  |
| 12. | Puducherry     | 23.10.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' needs to be reviewed as it has led to deterioration in quality of elementary education and created negative impact on the students' as well as parents' attitude and mentality. Therefore, 'No Detention Policy' needs to be restricted up to class V.   |
| 13. | Karnataka      | 30.10.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' should continue in its present form as it is important to sustain students' interest in education and provide minimum 8 years of school education. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) should be improved and monitored, year-end evaluation for a few classes should be conducted and students with low scores should be helped in improving their learning through special teaching.   |
| 14. | Delhi          | 28.10.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' needs to be amended as this has led to students being promoted to next class without achieving the desired learning level of a class and being able to comprehend and follow the subject taught. It further results in unreasonable and undisciplined behaviour of students or their dropping out of school. 'No Detention Policy' may be restricted up to Junior Primary class, i.e. class 3.   |
| 15. | Kerala         | 26.11.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' to be withdrawn as there is no harm in allowing a student one more year to recoup rather than allowing the student to pass to the next higher stage in an unbaked condition. The teachers will also be able to assess and correct themselves. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) process to be strengthened. Periodical, terminal and year-end examination will be necessary for an objective analysis of the learning level of the student.  |
| 16. | Andhra Pradesh | 30.11.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' should continue as otherwise the dropout rate would increase and it would be difficult to fulfil the objective of universalization of elementary education. Detention of students would demotivate them and lead to rote learning and undue fear of exams on the students and encourage malpractice and suppresses creative thinking, analytical ability, exploration and experimentation skills of the students. Annual examinations should be conducted to assess learning levels for class III, V and VIII. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) should be strengthened. Quality of teaching should be improved. |
| 17. | Gujarat        | 4.12.2015  | 'No Detention Policy' to be reviewed and suitably modified.  |
| 18. | Nagaland       | 3.12.2015  | 'No Detention Policy' needs to be reviewed as it has adversely affected both the students and teachers. The policy has made the students lazy and non-   |

|     |             |            |  |
|-----|-------------|------------|--|
|     |             |            | serious in their studies and the teachers too casual in their approach to teaching. The pass percentage and the grades/marks obtained by students in class IX and HSLC Examination have declined due to 'No Detention Policy'.   |
| 19. | West Bengal | 2.12.2015  | 'No Detention Policy' to be withdrawn as the learning outcomes and school environment has suffered due to the policy. Adequate safeguards may be put in place so that drop outs do not increase.   |
| 20. | Haryana     | 28.10.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' needs to be withdrawn as it has resulted in deterioration in the quality of education due to decreased commitment levels of stakeholders. The policy has resulted in lackadaisical attitude on part of both students and teachers. For the policy to succeed, optimum teacher-pupil ratio should be optimum, along with compulsory attendance and effective implementation of Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE). Tests/examinations provide students with competitive spirit besides motivating them to study. |
| 21. | Telangana   | 30.11.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' should continue to enable a child to learn better without fear of failure, detention and stigma. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) should be strengthened to evaluate the learning standards of the child regularly and which focuses not on rote learning but encourages creative and critical thinking.  |
| 22. | Maharashtra | 10.12.2015 | 'No Detention Policy' should continue with some changes as the policy has reduced school dropout rates and helps in building self esteem. Schools to test children at least thrice every year. States should be given freedom to decide whichever policy to follow.  |

Responses have not been received from balance 14 States and UTs.