

LOK SABHA
SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES
(Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Wednesday, July 24, 2024 / Sravana 2, 1946 (Saka)

***MATTERS UNDER RULE 377**

- (1) **SHRIMATI MALVIKA DEVI** laid a statement regarding the setting up of a Paika Regiment in the State of Odisha.
- (2) **SHRI LUMBA RAM** laid a statement regarding the need to provide funds for the construction of road from Gulabganj to Mount Abu under Central Road Fund.
- (3) **SHRI SURESH KUMAR KASHYAP** laid a statement regarding the need to complete the construction of Dr. Y.S. Parmar Government Medical College at Nahan, Himachal Pradesh.
- (4) **DR. BHOLA SINGH** laid a statement regarding the need to introduce a New Guaranteed Pension Scheme (NGPS) for Central Government Employees.
- (5) **SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB** laid a statement regarding the need for optimum utilization of Paradip – Haidaspur Railway line.
- (6) **SHRI MANSUKHBHAI DHANJIBHAI VASAVA** laid a statement regarding deployment of trained teachers and starting of training programmes for employment generation in tribal areas.
- (7) **CAPTAIN BRIJESH CHOWTA** laid a statement regarding plight of Arecanut farmers affected by spread of yellow disease in Dakhsina

* Laid on the Table as directed by the Chair.

Kannada Parliamentary Constituency.

- (8) **SHRI DUSHYANT SINGH** laid a statement regarding establishment of New Trauma Care Centres in the country.
- (9) **SHRIMATI MALA RAJYA LAXMI SHAH** laid a statement regarding request for sanctioning of Railway lines between Dehradun and Kalsi.
- (10) **SHRI JUGAL KISHORE** laid a statement regarding the need to provide immediate relief to the farmers for the damage of crops.
- (11) **SHRI PRADEEP KUMAR SINGH** laid a statement regarding development of purchase and storage centres and setting up of maize industry in Araria Parliamentary Constituency.
- (12) **SHRI MANOJ TIWARI** laid a statement regarding the problem of water logging in North East Delhi.
- (13) **DR. MOHAMMAD JAWED** laid a statement regarding review and beautification of Ramzan River in Kishanganj, Bihar.
- (14) **SHRI K. SUDHAKARAN** laid a statement regarding Human-Animal conflicts across Kerala.
- (15) **SHRI SATPAL BRAHAMCHARI** laid a statement regarding expansion of metro network upto Sonipat.
- (16) **DR. SHASHI THAROOR** laid a statement regarding the plight of handloom sector in the country.
- (17) **SHRI VIJAYAKUMAR ALIAS VIJAY VASANTH** laid a statement regarding construction of a statue of Perunthalaivar K. Kamaraj in the sea off the coast of Kanyakumari.
- (18) **SHRI LALJI VERMA** laid a statement regarding the need to provide compensation and employment to farmers affected due to land acquisition by NTPC.
- (19) **SHRI NARAYANDAS AHIRWAR** laid a statement regarding the

problem of irrigation in Jalaun Parliamentary Constituency.

- (20) **PROF. SOUGATA RAY** laid a statement regarding train accident in Darjeeling.
- (21) **SHRI T. M. SELVAGANAPATHI** laid a statement regarding setting up of a Defence Industrial Corridor at Salem.
- (22) **SHRI NARESH GANPAT MHASKE** laid a statement regarding the need to transfer Salt Department land to MBMC for developmental work in Thane Parliamentary Constituency.
- (23) **SHRI SACHITHANANTHAM R.** laid a statement regarding the establishment of a tourism corridor between Kodaikanal and Munnar.
- (24) **SHRI UMESHBHAI BABUBHAI PATEL** laid a statement regarding alleged corruption in UT of Dadra and Nagar Haveli and Daman.
- (25) **SHRI HANUMAN BENIWAL** laid a statement regarding the request for renaming of Railway station.
- (26) **SHRI BALYA MAMA SURESH GOPINATH MHATRE** laid a statement regarding various Railway related issues pertaining to Bhiwandi Parliamentary Constituency.

THE UNION BUDGET 2024-2025

And

**THE BUDGET OF UNION TERRITORY OF
THE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR 2024-2025**

And

**DEMANDS FOR GRANTS OF
THE UNION TERRITORY OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR 2024-2025**

KUMARI SELJA *initiating said:* Hon'ble Finance Minister referred to the poor, women, youth and our *Annadata* farmers in the Budget and we want to know

the details of the schemes devised for them. We made a demand that a caste census should be conducted, but the present government is maintaining stunning silence on this issue. There is no allocation for Haryana in the Budget presented by the Government and even its name has not even been pronounced. The Government had talked of doubling the farmer's income but the Budget of the agriculture sector has been reduced to almost half. It has been substantially reduced from 4.97 percent in the year 2019-20, to 2.74 percent in this Budget. Today there is so much agricultural crisis, particularly in our States, but no attention has been paid to it. According to NABARD, on an average, every farmer is in debt of of Rs 1.35 lakh. The Government does not pay any attention towards the farmers. Today the status of farmers and labourers has been reduced to their being helpless and labourers both. Moving on to the Crop Insurance Scheme the fact remains that you do collect premiums from the farmers against the crops but when it actually comes to paying compensation against the loss or damage of crops the farmers have to wait for years and years. In my parliamentary constituency, Narwana farmers have been awaiting compensation for the last three years. Insurance companies have clocked the profit of Rs 3,40,000 crore but when it actually comes to making payments to the farmers, they have to move from pillar to post and nobody pays heed to them. Unless the Government provides farmers with a legal guarantee of MSP, no justice can be dispensed to them. The Poor and the Youth need employment, Poor labourers should be afforded minimum wages. Essential food items like fruit and vegetables are becoming expensive for the Poor. Inflation should be curbed. Relief should be given to the common consumer. The unemployment rate is increasing day by day. There are 10 lakh vacancies under the Central Government and two lakh posts are lying vacant in Haryana which need to be filled. Besides, the backlog of Scheduled Caste and Backward Class communities should also be filled. There is no employment in Railways and Defence because the Government has stopped recruitment in all the jobs. We demand that the Government ought to do away with the Agniveer scheme immediately. There has been a difference of two percent between the Budget estimate and Budget expenditure over the last two years. The Government needs to take steps for children and for their issues related to hunger and malnutrition. There is no mention of Swachh Bharat anywhere. A provision for the Gurgaon-Faridabad Metro section was made in January 2016 but nothing has happened about the same till date. The Ballabgarh Metro project was sanctioned, but till date nothing is known about it. An International airport was

promised in the year 2019. The International Airport in Hisar should have been completed by the year 2021, but there is no mention of it. There is no mention of the Nuclear plant near Hisar, Gorakhpur.

BIPLAB KUMAR DEB: Under the able leadership of the Prime Minister, a transparent economy has been put in place since 2014. Despite economic disparity and the Corona epidemic, GDP growth of 6.5 to 7 percent has been estimated in the Economic Survey. It is a focused Budget. It mentions about 18.2 percent more capital expenditure compared to the year 2023-24. This Budget sets advancement towards an all-round development. In the next five years, 4.1 crore youths will be provided an opportunity to earn through Rojgar Kaushal Yojna. One crore youth will be given the internship opportunity by applying on the portal of the top 500 companies in the country. Under this scheme, they will be given Rs 6000 in the first month and subsequently Rs 5000 per month up to one year. This Budget has a provision of Rs. 1.48 lakh crore for education, employment and development. This Budget contains the provision of Rs 1.52 lakh crore for the farmers. This Budget has provided Rs. 1.75 lakh crore as an extra provision for fertilizers. Over the last ten years, approximately Rs. 14 lakh crore has been provided as MSP beginning from the year 2014 to 2023. Today, India holds the top position in milk production. It ranks first in the production of coarse grains and ranks second in the production of rice and wheat. Our Government has implemented 'Pradhan Mantri Matritva Vandana Yojna', 'Ujjwala Yojna', 'Surya Ghar Yojna', 'Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojna', 'Ayushman Bharat Yojna' and 'Pradhan Mantri Sadak Yojna'. Under the 'Jal Jeevan Mission', a provision has been made to supply water to every household. Eighty crore people are being provided free ration. Today, 25 crore families have been uplifted from the poverty line and joined the middle class. Our Government has ensured 33 percent reservation for women. Today, 10 crore women work in Self Help Groups and have become self-employed. I hail from North-East and there were only 9 airports during the Congress regime but today there are 16 airports in North-East. Today, the North-Eastern States export 85 percent more agricultural products. Our Government has worked towards addressing the Bodoland and Nagaland problem and has reduced the strength by 60 percent under AFPSA in North-East. Our Government has given the right to 36000 tribal families in Tripura to live there permanently by providing a package of Rs. 600-700 crore. In the next three years, the Indian economy is likely to become the

third-largest economy. This Budget encompasses all. In this Budget, almost Rs. 4.75 lakh crore will be distributed among all the State Governments through different schemes. In this Budget, the allocation for MGNREGA has been increased by Rupees 25000 crore. This Budget is a robust Budget which is focused on the youth, women and the poor.

SHRI VIRENDRA SINGH: Earlier, in all the states, the Budget was allocated to everyone according to their population and geographical location, but the Honorable Minister has changed this tradition. As if this Budget is intended to save the government. The Government has not made any provision regarding farmers in its Budget. There are two ways to increase the income of farmers – reducing agricultural costs and ensuring fair prices for agricultural produce. The Budget fails to do this. Farmers have been given a bundle of crop insurance. Our national president and leader of India Alliance has opposed the Agniveer scheme. About the Railways, the condition of ordinary passenger trains is very bad. There is a need to improve its condition because villagers commute on those trains. My demand is that additional trains should be arranged from Mumbai to Purvanchal. Also, more trains like GaribRath should be run in the country. The court should have guidelines that the cases of the poor should be disposed of properly. There is a great need to improve the public transport system. Technology should be developed so that lightning strikes can be predicted. In the event of any farmer's death due to lightning, the compensation amount provided to his dependents should be doubled. Health services and related infrastructure in villages have become very dilapidated. Trauma centres should be set up at appropriate distances in rural areas. I would like to thank the Prime Minister for setting up Bhabha Cancer Institute here, but the truth is that it has become a referral centre. The poor have to wait for six months to get treatment there. Diesel and petrol should be brought under the ambit of a uniform GST. The storage capacity for food items should be increased so that farmers can get benefits. I would also like to request that micro-level cottage industries related to agriculture and food should be protected.

SHRI ABHISHEK BANERJEE: It is a Budget without any clarity or vision which has been rolled out to satisfy the coalition partners of the BJP rather than providing any substantial relief to the 140 crore people of this country. It is an anti-people Budget. In 2024, the people of India have decisively rejected the Modi-led BJP Government which reigned supreme almost for a decade. This message from the electorate of this country is loud and clear. They have betrayed the citizens, housewives, daily-wage earners and the farmers. As far as price rise is

concerned, the price of food items is very high. The price of onions has gone up by 43 per cent, tomatoes by 41 per cent, potatoes by 39 per cent, and the price of an LPG cylinder crossed Rs. 1,100 in 2023. In the case of earnings, during the previous financial year 63 crore people earned less than Rs. 308 a day and 18 crore people earned less than Rs. 180 a day. India ranked 111th out of 125 countries in the Global Hunger Index. The Government have betrayed the marginalized communities. The crime against the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes has increased by 13 per cent and 14 per cent respectively from 2021 to 2023. Nearly 10,000 vacancies in Eklavya Model Residential Schools remain unfilled as of today. The unemployment rate in our country rose to an eight-month high of 9.2 per cent in June 2024. During 2022-23, the unemployment rate among graduates and postgraduates and above was 13 per cent and 12.1 per cent respectively. The target under Skill India Mission still remains a distant dream. The Skill India Mission aimed to train 400 million people by 2022, but only 14 million received training by 2024. The unemployment rate for women living in urban India is 22.7 per cent, whereas in West Bengal *Kanyashree Scholarship Scheme* touched the lives of 85 lakh girls, and won the UN Public Service Award. Over two crore twenty lakh women have been financially empowered through schemes like *Lakshmi Bhandar*. Financial assistance of Rs.12,000 annually for the general category and Rs.14,400 for women of SC/ST categories has been provided. Only three States in the country have enterprises where women own more than three out of 10 establishments, and these three States are Telangana, West Bengal and Karnataka. Moreover, this Government has spent Rs. 20,000 crore on revamping of Central Vista. What has this Government done for the homeless in the cities, in the towns, in the villages? Now, I come to the issue of depriving the rural poor. How much money did the Government give to MGNREGA after losing in Bengal in 2021? I am asking for a white paper. Lives of more than, 13,000 students are lost every year because of suicides. The ILO data reveals that the growth rate of real wages between 2006 and 2013 was 6 percent and between 2014 to 2021, it was down to 1.4 per cent. The Indian Railways made a bold proclamation about upgrading 40,000 conventional coaches to Vande Bharat standards and neglecting the fact that almost 96 per cent of passengers perform their journey in general and non-AC coaches. This apart, over one lakh persons involved in the farming sector tragically committed suicide between 2014 and 2022. Around 30 suicides every single day. The Government guaranteed that no home would suffer the

unavailability of electricity or water by 2022. They guaranteed to put an end to terrorism, but they failed again. Despite 334 Central and NLM teams visiting West Bengal in the last three years and ATRs being submitted, no funds have been released so far. The PM announced demonetization and guaranteed that black money would be wiped out. Sadly, 130 fellow Indians lost their lives due to heat and the strain of standing in long queues, falling victim to this eccentric decision. Similarly, Rs.672 crore was spent out of the requisite corpus of Rs.58,459 crore for the renewal of Railway tracks.

SHRI DAYANIDHI MARAN: The Union Government's share of funds for Chennai's Metro Rail has been lying pending for the last three years. Our Chief Minister has repeatedly written and urged for the said funds. But, the Union Government has not given even a single rupee till date. Our Tamil Nadu government has sent project proposals for the Coimbatore Metro Rail project and the Madurai Metro Rail project. But, we have not received any response in this regard yet. The middle class has faced the brunt of inflation, rise in food prices and rise in fuel and LPG prices for the last ten years. Russia – Ukraine war is going on at present and because of that the western countries are not buying fuel from Russia and Russian fuel is being bought by India. Compared to the petroleum price of 120 dollars per barrel in the international market, India is getting it for 60 dollars per barrel only. But, we Indian people are not getting any benefit from this price reduction. For the first time in India, windfall taxes have been brought by this Government. I would like to ask the Finance Minister to bring a white paper on the windfall taxes. The Government has announced targeted programmes relating to irrigation and flood mitigation. Bihar, Assam, Sikkim, Uttarakhand and Himachal Pradesh are getting assistance for flood management. But, what about Tamil Nadu? It faced the worst flood in Chennai recently. Tuticorin is facing the worst flood situation in the last 150 years. But, the Union Government has not provided any assistance for the relief work. The Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu had met the Prime Minister and made a demand for Rs. 37,000 crore as disaster relief. But, all of you will be surprised to know that the Union Government has given only 276 crore so far. The people of Tamil Nadu will never ever forgive the Government for this. The Finance Minister says that the Union Government will train 20 lakh people in a year under the Skill Development scheme. But, the Tamil Nadu government is already training 15 lakh people every year. It means, the Union Government, with

all its resources, is likely to train only 20 lakh people in a year. Actually, the Union Government is copying some of our schemes. The Union Government has announced a slew of schemes for their allies like Bihar and Andhra Pradesh but States like Tamil Nadu, Kerala, Telangana, and Karnataka have been completely ignored. We have no issues. But, it should not penalise other States. In Bihar, 15 bridges collapsed within one week. The Government is giving Rs. 26,000 crore to rebuild those bridges. Actually, the Government is rewarding the corrupt persons because it wants to stay in power. There was a lot of hope from the Budget. Everyone thought that it would be a pro-poor, pro-farmer, and pro-youth Budget. Expenditure on public health has decreased from 0.8 per cent to 0.16 per cent. Expenditure on welfare schemes for Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and minorities has declined from 0.16 per cent to 0.13 per cent. There is no mention of the census in this Budget. As many as 143 countries in the world have conducted the census successfully after the Corona pandemic. It is the first Government since Independence that has failed to conduct the census. So, the Government does not know how many people to plan for, what the state of human resources is and what the demography and economic structure are at the local, regional and national levels. So, how can we expect effective policy-making from this Government? This Budget lets down the poor and fails to address the growing economic inequality. Economic inequality has widened significantly over the past decade under this Government. The unemployment rate has risen to an alarming level. The data from an independent agency says that the unemployment rate was 8 per cent in 2020-21, and 7.3 per cent in 2022-23. According to the said data, the unemployment rate in India stood at 9.2 per cent in June 2024. An Inter-Ministerial Committee was set up in April 2016 to lay out a roadmap to double the farmers' income by the year 2022 as promised by the Prime Minister. However, the Government has failed miserably in achieving this target. When this Government came to power, it made a promise that a mega project of interlinking of rivers would be taken up. How many rivers it has interlinked so far? Schemes like PM Vishwakarma and PM Svanidhi to support artisans, self-help groups and entrepreneurs and many other schemes related to education, and the health sector are all commendable steps. But, why is my State Tamil Nadu not included? India's public healthcare system remains underfunded and overburdened. Rural areas face severe shortages of doctors and medical facilities. Caste-based discrimination and social inequalities persist. Dalits and other marginalised communities continue to

face significant socio-economic challenges. Inclusive policies and robust implementation are needed to ensure social justice. NEET is anti-social justice, yet the Government still remains adamant on not abolishing it. The Government refuses to fund our Chennai Metro Project or any other metro project and loads the States with the construction bill for housing projects. The Air Quality Index (AQI) in major cities continues to be hazardous, and deforestation rates have increased. Smart cities allocation is slashed to Rs. 2,400 crore for FY 25 from Rs. 8,000 crore in FY24. The FM has announced a diversified energy plan. Is there a mechanism for how this announcement will be implemented? No announcement has been made related to electric vehicles and FAME III, which will be critical to not just cleaner environments but also industry. The massive slash in the social sector spending over the years coupled with the unimaginative move to push capex once again has become the trademark of the BJP Budgets which provides little for the common people of this country. We are yet to see any result for the capex investments of the last few years. Schemes for minorities, the disabled, and pensions for the elderly have all been summarily reduced. The deadly combination of insufficient funding and rising inflation directly hurts our nation's poorest and most disadvantaged. All of us will be in support of fostering indigenous innovation and research, but where are the funds for such an announcement going to come from? So far as next-generation reforms are concerned how does the Government plan to ensure uniform implementation of land and labour reforms across States, given the varying levels of infrastructure and governance capabilities? In conclusion, the Union Budget has once again failed to meet the aspirations of the middle-class people. Nearly Rs. 4 lakh crore have been promised as subsidy for Andhra Pradesh and Bihar but Tamil Nadu has been completely ignored in this Budget.

SHRI SRIBHARAT MATHUKUMILLI: I would like to thank the Finance Minister for a visionary Budget, which exemplifies the Government's unwavering commitment to Viksit Bharat and the goal of making India the third-largest economy by 2027. I would like to highlight certain aspects of the Budget, which will help us become Viksit Bharat by 2047. The Budget focuses on infrastructure and capital expenditure. I would like to appreciate the Government for providing interest-free funds for multiple States across the country to leverage and to build their own infrastructure. I think the commitment of the Government to

give budget support to one crore families for building housing and to continue welfare support through the Pradhan Mantri Garib Kalyan Yojana to 80 crore people is much appreciated. I would like to especially mention the water management, sewage and solid waste treatment plan in about 100 cities and I hope that the city of Visakhapatnam that I represent is covered in it as we face acute challenges in our city with sewage and solid waste treatment issues. The solar plan for installing solar panels in one crore households for 300 units of free electricity is commendable. The Budget announcement to provide internship opportunities to one crore youth across the country is commendable. The major expenditure that any household incurs is on education and health care. So, this important scheme of loan support of about Rs. 10 lakh to every student pursuing higher education in domestic institutions is much appreciated. I think all of the production link incentives given in the technology, IT, and automobile sectors are all very necessary to provide opportunities for Indian citizens to pursue manufacturing in India. Investment into the space is very important. I would specifically appreciate the support of Rs. 15,000 crores announced for Amravati because Amravati is a project that is very historic and unique and the grants for the backward regions, Rayalaseema, Prakasham and North Coastal Andhra, which I represent. Andhra Pradesh now exports close to 40 percent of the seafood in India out of the \$8 billion industry and the announcement in this regard will really mitigate the production volatility and provide the livelihood stability for thousands of aqua farmers in our State. We would like to continue to seek Central support over the next few years because we would like Andhra to come back onto its feet. I request the Hon. Finance Minister to include the Vizag Steel Plant among the State enterprises. I would like to end my speech by saying that this gracious allocation for a State like Andhra Pradesh is very well received by the people of Andhra Pradesh.

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA YADAV: Several Members before me have maintained that this was the Budget for Bihar. Due to the geographical condition of Bihar, half of Bihar is reeling under floods and the rest half is troubled by drought, yet our Hon'ble Chief Minister tries to take Bihar to the heights with its limited resources. If the Government of India has given anything to Bihar, we presume that is not enough for us. Bihar deserves a lot more, which is why there has been a repeated demand from the State Government as well as from the representatives of

Bihar that Bihar should be accorded special status. If Bihar gets it, no one should have any objection to it. Money goes to those who are backward and those who actually need it. Nobody should have any objection about it. Given the backwardness of Bihar, Bihar has definitely got funds this time. We have also got funds for the road sector. Hon. The Prime Minister has also provided Rs 11500 crore for Kosi-Mechi International Link Project, barrage, river pollution prevention, renovation and other irrigation projects. We are grateful to him that he has accepted the proposal of the Hon. Chief Minister. This should make everyone happy. Bihar was backward from the tourism point of view. The Hon. Prime Minister has also cared for the development of tourism. Like the Kashi Vishwanath Temple corridor model, funds will also be provided for the Vishnupad Temple of Gaya and the Mahabodhi Temple of Bodh Gaya. Approval was granted for setting up a 10-kilowatt FM radio in my constituency, but the work is yet to be started. Airports are being developed everywhere. We want an airport to be built in Saharsa also. The Government of India may also approve the construction of an 'AIIMS' in Saharsa. A proposal for yard remodelling work at Saharsa Junction in our parliamentary constituency Saharsa at a cost of Rs 150 crore has been sent to the Railway Ministry under the Gati Shakti Yojana. I would request the Railway Minister that approval for its construction should be accorded. Light overbridge was approved, but that work has not been completed for years so, this work should be completed. The work related to the doubling of the Saharsa to Mansi-Madhepura railway section is not progressing. There is also an order regarding conducting a final location survey for the bypass of Saharsa Junction and Mansi Junction, but that work also remains incomplete. I would like to request the Hon. Prime Minister to introduce the Vande Bharat Sleeper train from Saharsa Junction to New Delhi. A foot overbridge may be constructed at Panchgachia station. In our parliamentary constituency, there are Ghoghsam and Kathdumar Ghats on the banks of the Kosi River, where a number of people die by drowning during every flood. I would like to demand from the Government that a bridge should be constructed at Kathdumar Ghat. There has been no decision regarding salary, allowances or pension of MPs for a long time. Therefore, I would like to request the Hon. Prime Minister that the issue of a hike in the salary of MPs should be considered.

SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SULE: I would like to make a small point before I get into the Union Budget as this is one more year after making Jammu and Kashmir a Union Territory against their wish. We are passing the Jammu Kashmir Territory Budget and their Demands for Grants. The hon. Home Minister has committed to this House that within a year they will hold elections and the Budget of the State will be discussed in their Assembly. So, I take this opportunity and request the Treasury Benches to keep their word and I hope next year elections are held in Jammu Kashmir and they pass their own Budget in their own State. So, I think this is a very important point and it must be done because if Parliamentary Elections can be held in Jammu Kashmir, why aren't assembly elections? I think the Government needs to even introspect why the environment for investment is not as good as it should be. As far as consumption is concerned, it is clearly not doing well, especially, the agrarian crisis and the rural economy. As far as the Export sector is concerned, we are number four globally. Yesterday, the Hon. Finance Minister said that the fiscal deficit is estimated at 4.9 per cent. My concern is, that once the supplementary demands come, it will probably go up. If the fiscal deficit goes up, what did we bring FRBM law for? I do not see anything about the census in this entire Budget. The Govt. talked about women, how much more they want to do for women, and how they have got the Women Reservation Bill which is still not implemented. But unless you do the census, how are you going to implement the Bill is my first question. When I started as an MP, there were 14 to 15 lakh voters. Now, the number has reached 23 lakh and the money we are getting is Rs. 5 crore. In Maharashtra, one MLA gets Rs. 5 crore per year. So, if I have six MLAs, the amount is actually equivalent to Rs. 30 crore. We are getting Rs. 5 crore. So, unless you do this delimitation, how are we going to manage this? Is the Government thinking of doing this and raising the funding for this? The other point is with regard to MPLAD. Either you increase the fund under that or stop that. An MLA gets Rs.5 crore and I am also getting Rs.5 crore. Why don't you increase it? That is one very important question. What is it about the fiscal deficit? I want a clear answer from this Government. What about the caste census? We definitely want to ask the Government. There are companies which have input tax credits. Now, input tax credit under the Goods and Services Tax is some thousands of crores of a scam. What has this Government done to make sure that such scams do not happen? What are the checks and balances? The Finance Minister of our state Maharashtra, which data says, never attends the GST Council meeting. So,

my State is always unheard of. What is the Plan-B for it, if a Finance Minister does not attend GST Council meetings? Maharashtra is never heard. So, I want some justice for that, and I want a solution for that. The Govt. is very proud of feeding 80 crore people. Every time they say that they are getting people out of poverty, how come you are still feeding 80 crore people after 10 years? I mean, it is the same number. What have they done to milk prices and casein? What have they done by banning the exports of onions? Apart from this, there has been only a meagre increase in the Budget for agriculture, health, education, infrastructure, and social justice sectors. In her reply, the Hon. Finance Minister should tell us what the plan of this Government is. If there is no good discipline of finances, in this country, unfortunately, I say this with great pain, there will be a complete economic crisis. I urge this Government to kindly reply to all these questions and reassure us.

DR. SHASHI THAROOR: This under-whelming Budget has been a woefully missed opportunity for, after all, this was the Government's chance to prove to the citizens of India, after the colossal setback the BJP suffered in the recently concluded general election, that the Prime Minister and the Finance Minister have actually listened to the concerns of the people. Once again, they have let the people of India down. The Budget is, in many ways, an emblem of this Government's economic mismanagement and financial recklessness made, all the more, worse by its divisive policies. This Budget makes it abundantly clear that the BJP has run out of ideas. Rather than being a vision statement of the economic future of the country, this Budget is an illustration, as has been pointed out by many of their politiquers, that their priorities chiefly revolve around appeasing their two regional allies, forgetting there are 26 other States and eight Union Territories whose people have nothing to be happy about. The four other States which have received Government support for natural calamities are all NDA-ruled States – Bihar, Assam, Sikkim and Uttarakhand. On the other hand, INDIA alliance states find themselves tasked out and ignored. Indeed, Karnataka, Tamil Nadu as well as my home State of Kerala have, time and again, sought funds for natural calamities from cyclones to rapid coastal erosion, but they have got none. The Government has completely disregarded the augmentation of existing healthcare infrastructure. The long-proposed AIIMS in Kerala has not been mentioned in the Budget. Today, the share of corporate taxes out of total tax collection is at the lowest level ever at

just 26 per cent while the share of personal income tax in total tax collections has increased to 28 per cent. Private investment has also gone down. In this Budget, healthcare has not been given importance at a time in India when 55 million of our most vulnerable citizens are annually cast below the poverty line because of having to spend on healthcare. This Government's health expenditure, as a proportion of GDP, remains stagnant and we are even distant from spending the minimum 2.5 per cent that was outlined by their Governments in the National Health Policy. The health insurance should be made far more affordable and accessible, especially for the middle section. The truth is that India's health and wellness centres need more funds and more staff to provide cost-effective treatment to ordinary Indians. In today's intensely competitive job market, access to quality and compulsory education has been wholly overlooked in this Budget. Education has been allocated a miserly Rs. 1.2 lakh crore, which is a seven per cent decrease from the revised estimated allocation of 2023-24. The Government's own New Education Policy of 2020 recommends that the education budget should be six per cent of GDP. The Budget has slashed the funding for the UGC by 60 per cent which will put an additional financial burden on students. The exaggerated claims of the Government that it added 125 million jobs in its 10 years, including 47 million last year, are completely fake. How many of those trained have been placed in real jobs? Why is the participation of the female labour force today at a record low of 28 per cent? The FDI as a ratio of GDP has collapsed from an average of two per cent of GDP to 0.5 per cent of GDP last year, the lowest in a decade. One big reason for stunted private investment is the heightened risk perception of the Indian economy. The Government has failed to allow the middle class to secure a *pakka* house for their families. On the front of infrastructure development also, the Government has failed miserably. Due to the high GST on hotels, India is among the costliest destinations. The *Kavach* system has only utilized less than half of the money allotted to it in the last Budget. This Government has kept reducing its allocations to MGNREGA. 267 percent of more job cards have been deleted this year, and the new Aadhaar-based payment system has left eight million active workers ineligible for payment. The Budget lacks originality, ambition and strategy.

SHRI BHARTRUHARI MAHTAB: This Budget is for the continuation of empowerment of the newly emerged neo-middle-class. This is a Budget that will take the country's villages, poor and farmers on the path of prosperity. The fiscal

deficit has been steadily reduced from 9.2 percent of the GDP in the FY 2021. Now, it is estimated that the fiscal deficit would be 4.9 percent of GDP. India has achieved higher growth in the post-pandemic period without compromising on financial stability. This Budget has specifically outlined the developmental programmes in the Eastern States covering Bihar, Jharkhand, West Bengal, Odisha and Andhra Pradesh of the country. Investment in infrastructure will facilitate investment and investment will generate employment which will ultimately help in the economic growth of the country. The Government of Odisha and the people of Odisha are not against the Polavaram project *per se*. Adequate funding is now going to be provided for the Polavaram project. But the concern of Odisha is that adequate measures need to be taken. Amid the rapidly rising trade deficit with China, despite efforts to curb imports and investment in the backdrop of the Galwan clash in 2020, some are advocating to attract investment from Chinese companies to boost imports. Should we import goods from China or import capital from China? That is the question. To boost Indian manufacturing, and plug India into the global supply chain, it is inevitable that India plugs itself into the China supply chain. Whether we do so by relying solely on imports or partially through Chinese investment is a choice that India has to make. There is a need to strike a balance between importing goods and FDI from China. Moreover, choosing FDI to benefit from the China plus one approach appears more advantageous than relying on trade. India has huge ambition in photo-voltaic semiconductor electric vehicles and pharma industries. India has a robust capacity for steel and yet sees significant imports of cheap Chinese steel. Indian industry must be spared the price pressure of Chinese imports. This Budget is a powerful signal of the Government's priorities and policy directions. Today, India is on track to achieve the Sustainable Development Goal of cutting multidimensional poverty by at least half by 2030. The focus on employment generation will be a big boost and provide the thrust for the growth of the economy. The support for the manufacturing sector, a package for employment generation and the skilling and upskilling for 4.1 crore youth across sectors are some of the key highlights of the Budget. This, coupled with the allocation of Rs.1.48 lakh crore for education and employment skilling, underscores the Government's commitment to harnessing India's demographic dividend. The plan to upscale 1,000 industrial training institutes is a pivotal step towards enhancing the skill sets of our future workforce. I am particularly heartened by the allocation of over Rs.3 lakh crore for women-led development

initiatives. A massive expansion in urban housing at an investment of Rs.10 lakh crore and rural roads programmes with Rs.26,000 crore is a big infra push. Indian companies in the private sector should come forward in employment generation and invest in new manufacturing capacities so that the country can complete its journey to Vikshit Bharat by 2047.

**

**

**

**

**

UTPAL KUMAR SINGH
Secretary General

**Supplement covering the rest of the proceedings is being issued separately

PRICE Rs. 12.00 © 2024 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debate of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopses of Lok Sabha Debates are also available at <https://sansad.in/lb>

that the Union Government in collaboration with the State Governments and Multi-Lateral Development Banks will bring water supply, sewage treatment and solid waste management projects in 100 big cities. We need more dams for Mumbai city. We will try to build the Gargai and Pinjal water supply project. We can bring 4,500 MLD water to Mumbai city through it. There is only one runway at Mumbai Airport. My demand is that if we develop the slum next to it under urban development scheme, then a second runway will be built there. Similarly, there should be two tracks on the Konkan Railway. Tourism should be promoted there. The forts of Shivaji Maharaj in Maharashtra should be developed. The cruise services will be launched for development in the areas of Alibagh, Dapoli, Guhagar, Ratnagiri and Sindhudurg.

SHRI LALJI VERMA: This is a discriminatory budget. Injustice has been done to farmers, youth, backward classes and scheduled castes. The guarantee of MSP to farmers has not been mentioned in the said budget. The input cost of the farmer has increased due to inflation. Concessions have been given to other sectors in the budget but there is no mention of agricultural equipment, on which there is a 28 percent GST. This budget is going to increase social and economic inequality. In this budget, there is no mention of caste census, backlog recruitment of backward classes, fulfilling the reservation of scheduled castes as well as guarantee of giving minimum support price to the farmers. Urban development has been mentioned about, but no provision has been made in this budget for rural development. No arrangement has been made to promote the Weaver Industry. We should make arrangements to provide electricity to weavers at cheaper rates, to purchase their production and to provide them thread at cheap rates. Uttar Pradesh has been discriminated against. It takes more than seven hours to travel from Ayodhya to Varanasi. No provision has been made in this budget for constructing an expressway from Ayodhya to Varanasi. The MPLAD fund is quite meagre. It is five crore rupees only. I demand that the MPLAD fund should be at least 20 crore rupees.

SUSHRI PRANITI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE: The Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojana boasts of providing an income support of Rs. 6,000/ to the farmers per year in three instalments of Rs. 2000/ however, 18% GST is levied on fertilizers and the farmers end up paying Rs. 18,000 by spending a

minimum of Rs. One lakh per annum on fertilizers. I demand that the amount of Rs.6000/ per annum should be increased to Rs. 12000/. Approximately, 50,000 persons are deprived of the benefits of Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojana in my constituency since it is not getting approval there. Pulses like Urad and Toor are cultivated in the Sholapur, Sangli, Satara and Kolhapur districts of West Maharashtra but the Pradhan Mantri Fasal Bima Yojana covers only millet, corn and soya bean crops. It is requested that Urad and Toor pulses should also be covered under the Pradhan Mantri Fasal Bima Yojana. All the pending proposals under the Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana should be sanctioned and an amount of Rs. 2 lakh 50 thousand should be allocated under the scheme. It is requested that the number of sleeper coaches in the Railways which is being reduced should rather be increased since the poor man travels by these coaches in the country. Funds should be allocated for Bormani Airport in Sholapur under the Udan scheme. 35 villages of Mangalveda Taluka are deprived of irrigation schemes which should be given approval at the earliest.

SHRI JAGADISH SHETTAR: The Budget mainly focuses on four major pillars - *Garib, Mahila, yuva and Anndaata*. I will focus mainly on the benefits of our start-ups, women's empowerment, consumption, MSMEs and job creation. As far as start-ups are concerned, the abolition of angel tax is a wonderful step in ensuring the continued success of our start-ups in the nation. Start-ups in agriculture are very important. It will be helpful to the farmers and it will facilitate women empowerment. To stimulate the local economy, the Budget envisages developing 100 weekly haats or street food hubs in select cities. Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) will create more employment opportunities at the national level for youth. The Budget has launched schemes to provide internship opportunities in 500 top companies for one crore youth over the next five years equipping them with the skills and experience needed to succeed in today's competitive job market. The Budget is offering an allowance of Rs.5,000 per month and one-time assistance of Rs.6.000 through the CSR fund providing crucial support to our young workers. UDAN scheme is for a limited period. It is requested that this period should be further extended. This will ensure more commercial activities in the cities and they will be further developed. The immediate resolution of disputes involving Kalasa-Banduri (Mahadayi river) between Karnataka and Goa, the Upper Krishna Project among Karnataka, Andhra

Pradesh and Telangana and the Kaveri river water dispute between Karnataka and Tamil Nadu will be beneficial for the economy. Providing a fillip to the economic activities and launching more irrigation projects in these areas will bring prosperity to the farmers and boost economic development in the country.

SHRI ANIL YESHWANT DESAI: The Budget outlines a total expenditure of Rs. 48.21 lakh crore and receipts of Rs. 32.07 lakh crore which excludes borrowings. The fiscal deficit is projected at 4.9 percent of GDP. I hope the Government would contain this deficit well within the limits prescribed. States like Maharashtra, Haryana, and Jharkhand should have been allocated proportionate share in allocation. The Budget focuses on four major groups – women, the poor, the youth and the farmers. Unemployment has reached its peak at the rate of 9.2 per cent. The Central Govt. Departments and undertakings should take up recruitment drives and encourage State Governments to fill in their vacancies in various departments. Private sector corporations should also be urged to take up recruitment drives. Permanent jobs have become a word of the past and contract basis has become the norm. I sincerely request the Hon. Finance Minister to review the devolution of funds and increase the share of Maharashtra substantially in the coming years. The Budget does not reflect the Government's promised focus on rail safety despite several rail accidents in recent times. The implementation of Kavach providing for the National Automatic Train Protection System is slow. The provision for Central Government schemes like MGNREGA is being reduced now to Rs. 60,000 crore from Rs. 86,000 crore in 2023-24. Lesser provision has been made in Research & Development projects, this year solar power grid also face a similar downsizing of budget. No relief has been given to the salaried middle class. The GST council needs to review the GST charged on Mediclaim policy which is 18 per cent making it unaffordable. The New Pension Scheme should be replaced by the Old Pension Scheme.

SHRI DHARMENDRA YADAV: This NDA government is presenting its 11th budget. But despite this 11th budget, if I go through it, allocations for the most essential items for the poor in society are falling short. During the 2014 elections, the Hon. Prime Minister promised that two crore jobs would be created every year. Since 2007-08, there has been a continuous demand in the country that the recommendations of Swaminathan ji, such as giving 1.5 times the support price

to farmers, guarantee of MSP, legal rights and entitlements, have not been accepted to date. The budget provision for the Education sector is being continuously reduced. The budget of UGC is being continuously reduced. I openly accuse this Government of conspiring to deprive poor people of education by privatising it and giving it into the hands of a handful of industrialists. The Government is continuously increasing the fees, there is a shortage of teachers. This Government is not able to provide employment. Social inequality in the country has increased more since 2014. I demand the government to implement OPS. The honorarium of Anganwadi workers should be increased. The martyred soldiers should be cremated with national honours at their homes. I request that the Agni Veer scheme be abolished. The Union Government should allocate an additional budget to develop the martyrdom site of the martyrs as Shaheed Sthal. Like Bihar, a special package should also be given to Uttar Pradesh. A budget should be allocated for the railway line from Gorakhpur to Banaras via Azamgarh.

SHRI SUKHDEO BHAGAT: This budget is not meant for the 140 crore people of the country, it is a budget to save the Government. In the budget, the government has copied the five guarantee schemes of the Congress Party. Good ideas are borrowed, not stolen. The Bharatiya Janata Party has borrowed it, so it is natural to have flaws or mistakes in it. The growth rate of agriculture was 4.7 percent in the year 2022-23, but it is 1.4 percent in the year 2023-24. The government remains silent on the matter of providing legal status to MSP. This budget is against the poor people. India ranks 111th in the Hunger Index and the Government has reduced food subsidies. As far as education is concerned, the education budget has been reduced by seven percent. The share of personal tax in the revenue receipts of the Government of India is 19 percent and the share of corporate tax is 17 percent. A huge relief was given in corporate tax in the year 2019. This concession was given so that employment could be created, but it did not happen. Despite the concessions, neither private investment increased nor employment was created. Instead of cutting corporate tax, if one-fourth of the amount was spent annually on consumption boost, then domestic consumption expenditure would not have decreased and our economy would have definitely strengthened. The highest expenditure in the budget is on interest payment, which is 25 percent of the total expenditure. That is why, we should sensibly before borrowing.

SHRI ABHIJIT GANGOPADHYAY: The increase in the standard deduction will leave a lot of money in the hands of employed persons which in turn will create a lot of demand for goods and services in the economy. The savings part will naturally go to his banker. Their savings equal to investment conception will show that the banker will have a huge amount of money to give loans to the industrialists. When a large amount of money comes to the market in the form of investment, new industries will be set up to serve the extra demand. This demand-supply equation, which will come into the market from the unleashed huge amounts of money pumped from the lower middle-class section, will definitely change the face of the economy.

The discussion was not concluded.

UTPAL KUMAR SINGH
Secretary General

© 2024 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debates of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopsis of Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>