

LOK SABHA
SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES
(Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Friday, February 9, 2024 / Magha 20, 1945 (Saka)

OBITUARY REFERENCES

HON.SPEAKER: Hon. Members, with profound grief, I have to inform the House about the passing away of two of our former colleagues.

SHRI HARMOHAN DHAWAN was a member of the 9th Lok Sabha representing the Chandigarh Parliamentary Constituency of Union Territory of Chandigarh. Shri Dhawan was Minister of State (Independent Charge) in the Ministry of Civil Aviation and also served as member of the Committee of Privileges.

SHRI HARMOHAN DHAWAN passed away on 27 January, 2024 at the age of 83 years.

SHRIMATI RUBAB SAYEDA was a member of the 14th Lok Sabha representing the Bahraich Parliamentary Constituency of Uttar Pradesh. Smt. Sayeda served as a member of the Committee on Industry and Committee on Information Technology.

SHRIMATI RUBAB SAYEDA passed away on 6 February, 2024 at the age of 73 years.

We deeply mourn the loss of our former colleagues. I am sure the House would join me in conveying our condolences to their bereaved families.

The Members then stood in silence for a short while.

***MATTERS UNDER RULE 377**

- (1) **SHRI SU. THIRUNAVUKKARASAR** laid a statement regarding four-laning of National Highway and conversion of State Highways into National Highways in Tiruchirappalli parliamentary constituency, Tamil Nadu.
- (2) **SHRI SHYAM SINGH YADAV** laid a statement regarding refund of money to people who invested in Sahara group.
- (3) **SHRI ABDUL KHALEQUE** laid a statement regarding revival of Match factory in Dhubri, Assam.
- (4) **SHRI RAGHU RAMA KRISHNA RAJU** laid a statement regarding the need to constitute a committee to control shrimp prices in the country.
- (5) **SHRI VINAYAK BHAURAO RAUT** laid a statement regarding restoration of the Old Pension Scheme.
- (6) **SHRI ANUBHAV MOHANTY** laid a statement regarding the need to introduce passenger train services in Kendrapara district, Odisha.

OBSERVATION BY THE SPEAKER

HON. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, I have to inform the House that the entire day shall be dedicated to the detailed discussion on the white paper concerning the Indian economy and its impact on the lives of the people of India. Four hours' time has been allotted for consideration of the Motion by the House.

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE AND MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN): *moved that:*

“That this House do consider the White Paper on the Indian Economy and its impact on lives of the people of India.”

* Laid on the Table as directed by the Chair.

This is a White Paper on the Indian economy and its impact on the lives of the people of India. The White paper has been laid on the Table by the Government after 10 full years of pulling out the Indian economy, which was among the 'fragile 5', to scale it up to reach the stage of top five economies and at the threshold of being the one among the top three economies. It is a statement made with responsibility so that factual information on the economy may remain on the records of the Lok Sabha and the Rajya Sabha. It shall be available on record for our posterity and shall be used as reference material in future to get an insight as to what it took our visionary Prime Minister to restore the glory of India. I would like to state a few facts to initiate Debate on this matter. The UPA government did not save India after the Global Financial Crisis, but we are aware of how the Hon. Prime Minister handled the country after COVID-19, provided free vaccines to everyone and protected the country. What happened in this country during the Commonwealth Games held in Delhi for 12 days, it brought a bad name to India the world over. But see today, the G-20 was organised all over India. Not a single State was left out and they were asked to showcase their local products to foreign guests and promote their tourism. But, the UPA government caused huge losses to the country through the coal scam. In the CAG report on the Coal Scam, it was unearthed that a loss of Rs 1.86 lakh crore was caused to India. The Supreme Court took this situation very seriously and cancelled the licences of 214 coal blocks. What effect did it have on the country? Due to this, there was job loss, investment stopped coming into the country, and small and medium-scale industries came to a standstill. To generate electricity, coal had to be imported. There is plenty of coal in the country, yet its import was resorted to. Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh suffered major revenue losses attributed to this move. The Hon. Prime Minister provided the pipeline gas connection and reconstructed Barauni Refinery. We got the Coal Mines Special Provision Act passed in the year 2015. The District Mineral Fund was also created in the year 2015 under the provisions made through the MMDR Amendment Act. By opening 100% FDI, every facility has been put in place to facilitate investment through an automatic route, resulting in attracting investments. In order to commercialise coal mining we have brought an open policy. Under the policy, coal blocks were allocated 9 times in the auction since the year 2020. The District Mineral Fund was established by our law. No one lent a thought to it earlier. Rs 84,900 crore has been collected from The District Mineral Fund in all the states. Thanks to this, many aspirational districts and blocks are also having better times today. Good work is being done by setting up

digital dispensaries from the District Mineral Fund of various States and facilities like basic health care, telemedicine consultation, and free medicine are being dispensed and malnourishment is being addressed. Domestic coal production has reached 900 million tonnes in the year 2023-24. It is likely to reach 1 billion tonnes in the coming year. In 2013-14 it was 567 million tonnes. This has led to an increase in production, there will be no import of coal, and there will be no foreign exchange payment either. The public sector did not benefit from the policy of the UPA government. During 2013-14 to 2022-23, the public sector undertaking Coal India Limited's capital expenditure has increased 4.3 times as compared to the earlier era. So, the public sector is also thriving in terms of production and is also making investments. One of the characters of the Congress party is to play with the Banks. They constantly misused their powers and played with the Banks. In 1976, the chairman of the State Bank of India was persecuted by the CBI for not disbursing loans to the party enjoying close proximity with the erstwhile Government during the Emergency. In the year 1950, 1.26 crore shares were put in the company that became bankrupt by exerting influence on the LIC Investment Committee. Which culminated in the removal of the Finance Minister concerned as a scapegoat. From 2004 to 2014, the UPA had advertised 'make a call, get a loan' in the name of phone Banking. With the gift of recommendations, the NPA crisis started from that time and even there was no collateral or the entire loan was given by giving half collateral. Now, we are going to rectify the NPAs. The gross non-performing asset ratio in the public sector Banks increased by 12.3 per cent in 2013 itself. Return on assets for public sector Banks fell from 0.97 percent to 0.5 percent between 2009-10 and 2013-14. Top 200 companies in March 2014 owed about 8.6 lakh crore to the Banks. Nearly 44 per cent of those loans were yet to be recognized as problem assets. Our government recapitalised Banks, and did an asset quality review, The Reserve Bank of India issued orders to this effect. We made the strategy of 4R- Recognition, Resolution, Recapitalization and Reforms. IBC brought such laws that the cases can be dealt with quickly and the money of the Bank is recovered. The Banks were merged and then professional boards and independent directors were appointed. Today we are seeing its good results. There is a decline in the gross NPA ratio to many years low of 3.2 per cent. Profitability of PSBs increased from Rs. 37,000 crore to Rs. 1.08 lakh crore. The Banks are handing over record dividends to the Government, which has enabled us to launch public welfare programs. Today the same Banks that were debt-ridden are becoming the pillars of public welfare today.

Today, we are undertaking good programmes like Revival of Credit Growth, Capital Formation and Mudra Sva Nidhi for public welfare. Scaling up of the whole economic growth and driving it to a robust level is largely attributed to the good steps, policies, and legislative measures that we undertook with transparency be it Banks or the coal sector of India,

SHRI N. K. PREMACHANDRAN *moved the substitute motion that:*

“Having considered the white paper this house disapproves of the contents of the white paper on the following grounds;

This is a political attempt to ignore the valuable efforts of the previous UPA Govt and the contributions of the renowned economists, Scientists and experts of the country during the period 2004-2014. After 10 years of the NDA govt in office, making baseless allegations against the previous govt. is unfair, improper, unjust and against all basic tenets of parliamentary democracy. During 10 years of NDA-led govt, the country had experienced exponential growth of unemployment, inflation resulting in price rise of essential commodities, and increased actual poverty. Shifting the blame to the previous govt for the abysmal failures of this govt. and thereby avoiding its own responsibility is not proper. The NDA Govt in power for 10 years has devastated the country’s economy and agriculture sector, abetted crime against women and committed a grave injustice to Minorities.”

PROF. SOUGATA RAY *moved the substitute motion that:*

“this House disagrees with the conclusion reached by the White Paper on Indian Economy.”

SHRI MANISH TEWAR *Initiating said:* This is a political manifesto, this is not the White Paper. When the UPA Government came to power in 2004, we carried out fundamental reforms that strengthened the economic, social and political foundations of our people. First of all, we gave the Right to Information to 130 crore people. I regret to say that that it is common knowledge how that the Right to Information has been decimated from 2014 to 2024. The second major achievement is the MNREGA. In 2005, the UPA Government brought the MNREGA. We legally ensured that those willing to get 100 days of work will get work. I want to ask why from 2014 to 2024, that 100 days were not made 101 days? Third, there is the law of free education. Children in the age group of 6 to 14 years irrespective of caste and religion would be imparted free education across the country. Fourth, there is the

National Food Security Act. It was the UPA Government that gave wheat, rice and coarse grains at affordable prices to 77 per cent of the population of this country. Fifth, there is 'Aadhaar'. I would like to ask what has been the achievement of this Government over the last ten years. This government implemented the GST in such a way that it destroyed the entire small-scale industry of India for many years. As far as the economy is concerned, when we took over in 2004, the fiscal deficit was 4.5 per cent. In 2007-08, the recession was reduced to 2.8 per cent compared to the global recession. The revenue deficit in 2003-04 was 3.6 per cent. It came down to 1.2 per cent in 2007-08. The savings-to-GDP ratio, which runs the economy, has increased from 29.8 per cent in 2003-04 to 34 per cent in 2006-07. The investment-to-GDP ratio increased from 28.2 per cent in 2003-04 to 35.9 per cent in 2006-07. From 2004 to 2008, the Minimum Support Price was increased by Rs.300. From 1998 to 2002, the inflation rate was 5.15 percent which fell to 5.12 percent from 2004 to 2008. From 1999 to 2004, the average growth rate of the economy was 5.8 percent, which increased to 8.9 percent in the first four years of the UPA. There are five main pillars of any economy i.e. savings, consumption, investment, production and employment. In the year 2013 savings to GDP ratio was 34 percent but in the year 2022, it was reduced to 30 percent. In the year 2013-14, private financial consumption expenditure was 60 percent but in the year 2023-24 it declined to 56.9 percent. The investment to GDP ratio was 33.8 per cent in the year 2013-14 and it fell to 29.20 per cent in the year 2023-24. The fiscal deficit is in the range of 17-18 lakh crore rupees. The gross capital formation was 33.8 per cent in the year 2013-14 which declined to 31.4 per cent in the year 2022-23. The rate of unemployment was 4.9 per cent in the year 2013-14 but it is 8-9 per cent in the year 2022-23. The rate of unemployment has increased in the country during the last 10 years. The Government has said that 25 crore people were liberated from multidimensional poverty but it is also a fact that 27 crore people were pulled above the poverty line from the year 2004 to 2014. They say that the Government which brought 27 crore people above the poverty line did nothing. What kind of logic is this? The Government maintained in the Budget speech that it is providing free ration to 80 crore people. We enacted the National Food Security Act. But I want to ask what happened to unemployment? When we left the Government in the year 2013-14 the Budget of MGNREGA was 33 thousand crore rupees. In the year 2023-24, it has been increased to 86 thousand crore rupees. It means the economy is not creating avenues of employment. The number of people seeking employment under

MGNREGA has increased twofold. The rate of inflation was 5.3 per cent in the year 2013-14 which has since gone up to 5.4 per cent in the year 2023-24. Hon'ble Minister of Finance says that there was so much inflation during our rule. Our economy has now become a 3.75 trillion dollar economy but the government's loan has increased threefold. The economy is growing not because of increased revenue collection. It has scaled up due to the huge amount of loans raised by the Government during the last 10 years. The biggest component in the budget that accounts for 28 per cent is of borrowings and the biggest outgo i.e. 20 per cent is interest payment bears a striking testimony to it. Indian economy grew at the rate of 6.8 per cent cumulatively during the year from 2005 to 2014. From the year 2015 to 2024 it increased at the rate of 5.9 per cent. The growth rate of the economy was on the higher side during our rule of 10 years. When we made an exit from the Government on 26 May 2014, 1 dollar was equal to 58.65 rupees. On 4th February 2024, 1 dollar is equal to 82.93 rupees. The Government must think about it. There has been a significant increase in the prices of LPG, diesel, petrol and mustard oil, flour, milk etc. over the last 10 years. The common man has severely borne the brunt of inflation during the last 10 years. The Government has been talking about phone banking for the last 10 years but what kind of action have they taken in this regard? The Insolvency and Bankruptcy Act has institutionalised the Bank loot.

DR. NISHIKANT DUBEY: The Economy of India may be divided into three phases. The first phase commenced in the year 1947 and continued till 1990. It is known as licence, quota, and permit raj. From the year 2004 to 2014 it was Loot Raj and from 2014 to the year 2024 it is known as Ram Rajya. Hon'ble Prime Minister says that India has faith in Lord Ram. It appears to me that the opposition has faith in corruption. Today the opposition stands united and its only reason is corruption. Did they make any serious attempt to put a check on black money? When the Hon'ble Prime Minister took charge, he set up a task force on black money in the very first Cabinet meeting. I agree that the prices of petrol, and diesel were increasing rapidly during the rule of the opposition. What did they do to contain it? They issued oil bonds as sovereign guaranty and the responsibility to repay them lay on the succeeding Government. When they say that GDP growth was 5.8% from the year 1998 to 2004 they should also refer to the growth rate of the years 1997, 1996, 1995, and 1994- it was 2 percent, 3 percent, 3.5 percent, and 4 percent respectively. When we took charge the growth of the economy was only 3

percent. Sir, there were many economists in their Government and they spoiled the economy. Hon'ble Minister of Finance said that the NPA of Banks was around 13 percent when our Government took charge in the year 2013-14. Today NPA is about 3 percent. When the erstwhile RBI Governor appeared before the Estimate Committee he deposed that the condition of banks had turned from bad to worse due to political corruption. The UPA Government brought a policy in the year 2013. Hon'ble Finance Minister said that so much import of gold is affecting our Balance of Payment adversely. The Ministry of Economic Affairs issued an order on 14th May 2014 to RBI and import of gold ensued. Gold imported in Delhi started to be exported from Haridwar within five hours. It was a big scam. In the Antrix Devas Deal, Antrix signed an agreement with Devas without any collateral. The then Minister of Finance signed this agreement on 28-01-2005 and it was maintained that arbitration would be held in another country. The Government of India is still paying the price for it. We want 'Make in India'. Defence is a sector where we are in a position to export. Export to the tune of one lakh crore rupees has been made from the defence sector. Corruption has neither increased nor will it be allowed to spiral up during the tenure of our Government. We need to understand the status of Banking. There were no branches of the Bank in our area. The people used to invest their money in Chit Fund Company, Multi-State Cooperative Company or such misleading schemes which led to the underdevelopment of States like West Bengal, Bihar and Jharkhand. There was a Saradha Chit Fund scam in Bengal in which cash was seized from different Ministers. This seized amount is being misused by a political party whose single point agenda has been to nourish the Muslim vote bank. Jharkhand and Bihar had been riddled with corruption for 15 years. The people belonging to Bihar had to serve as migrant labourers in various parts of the country. Railways receive more than 40 percent of revenue from Jharkhand alone. Our Government has made a huge contribution in taking this country forward. Land for job schemes is mentioned in the White Paper. The job was offered only to those who paid bribes. The land of children whose parents were not in a position to pay the money was usurped leading to the spoiling of careers of the innocent job-seeking candidates. The economy in earlier times was a corrupt one. A scam of about Rs 60 lakh crore was done from the year 2004 to the year 2014. All this money is deposited in the form of black money from Switzerland to tax havens. We need to know about these flaws in the economy at present.

DR. KALANIDHI VEERASWAMY: I would like to highlight the status of the Indian economy since the pre-Independence era. After we got our Independence in 1947 from British rule, India's GDP was only about one per cent of the world's GDP. Our Government at that time faced the biggest challenge of nation-building. Many things had to be taken care of. Poverty was the biggest threat to our nation at that point in time. The Green Revolution and White Revolution were focused upon to improve agricultural production and milk production. In 1991, the economy of the country opened up and improved under the capable leadership of the then Prime Minister, Mr P.V. Narasimha Rao and the Finance Minister Dr Manmohan Singh. After assuming office, our Hon. Prime Minister promised that two crore jobs would be offered to people every year and that the prices of gas and petrol would be halved. Adding further it was also claimed that the exchange rate of the US dollar would be reduced but even after ten years today there is no mention of these things in the White Paper presented by the Government. It does not find mention of demonetization, its effects and achievements. All the opposition parties have been asking for the same. The whole exercise of demonetization seems futile as there is no mention of the same. This Government has only increased the cess throughout the country since 2014. Over the last two years, the Government has imposed windfall tax on oil companies. This windfall tax is for making excessive profits and it has been informed that the cost of petrol and diesel is now market-driven and not under their control. The Government claims to have alleviated 25 crore people out of poverty but it is far from the truth. During the COVID period, eighty crore people had to be provided free rations which is something commendable. Now after that pandemic is over, the same promise has been repeated for the next five years. The dependence of 80 crore people, which accounts for 55 per cent of the country's population, on free ration for sustenance is a sad state of affairs. With reference to the scams highlighted by the Hon. Minister, I would like to ask the Government why no action had been taken by the present Government during their rule for ten years. The Government is only interested in making accusations against the Opposition. A Commission should have been set up to inquire into the CAG report to bring out the truth.

PROF. SOUGATA RAY: I think the Hon. Minister of Finance should first apologize to the entire nation for demonetization. Such a big scam has never happened in history. Before demonetization, Rs 16 lakh crore was in the cash system

and after demonetization, Rs 16 lakh crore came back. Where did this money come from? This Government says that it is against corruption. I want to know where Nirav Modi, Mehul Choksi, and Vijay Mallya are. You have the Fugitive Economic Offenders Act. Still, you could not bring back Nirav Modi, Mehul Choksi, and Vijay Mallya to the country. We do not support corruption so when the coal scam happened we came out of UPA. I am not saying that everything was fine in UPA but the UPA brought MNREGA for the poor. The UPA had brought the National Food Security Act, Forest Rights Act and the Right to Information Act. The UPA had brought Aadhaar in 2006. When there was an economic crisis all over the world, our Banking system faced it. Economic reforms stopped during your time. This Government only uses ED and CBI. It is said that big scams have taken place. Was there any conviction even in one scam? You could not convict even a single person. You are speaking about Banking. If the erstwhile Rajan had not done the first asset quality review, the Bank would have collapsed. But these people did not let him work. The Hindenburg report came about Adani. This Government has not given any opinion regarding the Hindenburg Report. There was a scam in the Rafale deal during your time. Why doesn't the Government bring it forward? You have spoken about the Saradha Chit Fund. No action was taken there also. To date not a single person has been convicted. Retail inflation has increased upto 5.69 percent in December. The price of everything is increasing. There is not a single world-class economist in this Government. They had implemented GST. They had brought Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code but only 20 percent of the Bank loan is being recovered. The Finance Minister did not talk of suicide committed by t 30,000 farmers and agricultural labourers. She also did not say that women's participation in the workforce is very low. We are ranked 161th in the world on the World Press Freedom Index. Our economic structure is not for the poor. There is no equality in that. India has failed to take advantage of rising labour costs in China. The country's infrastructure has many shortcomings in supporting a dynamic manufacturing sector. Our education system does not provide vocational skills to the youth. Only a few big people enjoy the benefits of the country's development. The Government has no answer to unemployment and inequality.

***SHRIMATI VANGA GEETHA VISWANATH-:**

* Please see Supplement

SHRI GIRISH CHANDRA: Our party is of the opinion that before the next Lok Sabha general elections, the game of making serious allegations and counter-allegations and proving each other wrong and anti-people by issuing black papers and white papers between the Congress Party and the BJP is nothing but selfishness. How can the country, public interest and public welfare be possible through such narrow politics? Today, crores of people of the country are constantly suffering from stressful life due to high inflation, immense poverty, unemployment, plight of farmers and plight of rural India etc. It is very important for all political parties to give up selfishness and hatred etc. and make a united effort on the most pressing national problems of the country. The correct assessment of the policy and activities of every Government depends on the better livelihood of the people and their happiness and happy life. The record of both the Congress and BJP Governments in this matter is neither remarkable nor commendable. If the record of UPA's 10-year tenure had been excellent then BJP would not have got a chance to come to power in the country. Similarly, if the tenure of the present Government in the last 10 years had been excellent in terms of public interest, public welfare, national interest, social and religious harmony, peace and order etc., then crores of people would have never been so troubled and miserable in every sphere of life. Lack of expected increase in the per capita income of the people of the country, big capitalists becoming more prosperous, SC, ST and OBC reservations being made inactive and ineffective and no significant reduction in corruption in common life, are some of the issues for public interest. There are specific issues which continue to disturb people and which are diverting the country from its ambitious objective of equitable and welfare development. It would have been good if the development of the country's economy had been employment-oriented rather than employment-free and the benefits of this development would have been available to all sections of the society. I demand that the way you have honoured Karpoori Thakur ji with Bharat Ratna, in the same way if you honour Shri Kanshi Ram with Bharat Ratna then crores of Dalits, backward classes, Muslims, people of all sections of the society will be happy.

SHRI GAURAV GOGOI: This white paper is not a white paper but an election stunt. This is an attempt to hide all the failures of the government. It is regrettable that the order for the release of a drug-related criminal in Manipur comes from the Chief Minister's office. Another report came regarding the Ayushman

Bharat scheme as to what kind of corruption is happening in Ayushman Bharat today. The audit noted that around 7.5 lakh beneficiaries were registered against the same mobile number and no verification was done. Claims are being filed in the name of 90 thousand people who have died. No action is being taken on that. Today ED has become another arm of BJP. ED's job is to catch the corrupt. But today ED is their special weapon to suppress democracy and the voice of opposition and how to include corrupt people in the BJP. Had they allowed ED to work, it would have caught all the people who have absconded abroad today. There are about 31 people abroad who owe a debt of Rs 40 thousand crore, but today ED is not apprehending them. If the Prime Minister is so powerful in the world then why does he not bring back these people hiding abroad?

SHRI RAJIV RANJAN SINGH 'LALAN': I welcome the white paper brought by the Hon'ble Finance Minister on the country's economy because a situation of confusion was created in the country that our country's economy is on the brink of collapse. The white paper contains complete details of the figures. When did Vijay Mallya get a loan of Rs 8,040 crore? If you had honestly said that your government gave a loan of Rs 8,040 crore to Vijay Mallya and he ran away with it, then we would have believed that you were honest. You were discussing Nirav Modi. When did Nirav Modi's fraud start? It started in the year 2011, when Dr. Manmohan Singh ji was heading the government. Guaranteed default of Rs 14,000 crore occurred but you remained a mute spectator. This was your financial mismanagement. Now this government is making efforts to bring him back. Mehul Choksi committed a fraud of Rs 8,738 crore with banks from November 2010 to April 2014. Whose government was there at that time? At that time it was your government. The White Paper discusses your financial mismanagement. It reflects the work you have done and it does not go down well with you. When you implemented MNREGA, the wage was Rs 145 and in this government, the same wage is Rs 204. You did not refute the White Paper on the basis of facts. When your government was in power from 2004 to 2014, there was not a session when a new scam was not discussed. A number of scams like the Coal scam, the Spectrum scam, the Defence scam, Commonwealth Games scam took place and the whole country saw it. If the figures in the white paper are wrong, then those figures should be refuted. A comparison table has been made between the years 2004-2014 and the years 2014-2024. You would have contradicted the table, which you are not able

to do. I congratulate the hon'ble Finance Minister for bringing the White Paper and making the entire country aware of the country's economy.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: The white paper presented by the Hon'ble Finance Minister is a very substantial step and the country should know about it. There is also a discussion going on here to tell the country about it. It is a very important day because economic reforms are also being discussed. I would like to thank the Prime Minister who announced to confer Bharat Ratna on the architect of reforms in the country's economy Narasimha Rao ji, farmers' leader Charan Singh ji, and great agricultural scientist Dr. Swaminathan ji. Our Government honours those who work for the country. When we visit abroad, we should not criticise our country. India has moved from the 'fragile five to the powerful five'. We have driven the country from the world's eleventh economy to the fifth economy and will take it forward to the third position in the next two years. Earlier, a scam used to be exposed every week but now the Government is headed by an honest Prime Minister and no corrupt person will be spared. If someone indulges in corruption, he or she will surely be punished. During the UPA regime, scams were committed everywhere. The 2G scam was carried out under the guise of 'first come first serve'. Land was taken from people in lieu of offering them jobs in the Railways. Due to these scams, the confidence of investors in the country was shaken and they started feeling that it is no longer appropriate to invest capital in this country. But the situation has changed after our Government was formed. The IMF and the world's largest companies are saying today that India is one of the best economies in the world. Now India has received the highest foreign investment. During the Corona pandemic, under the leadership of the Hon'ble Prime Minister, the people of the country were administered Made in India vaccine free of cost, which has been a big achievement. Our Government has improved India's economy and today 25 crore people have been brought Above the Poverty line. India has made great strides in the digital electronics sector and it is now the second-largest mobile phone manufacturer in the world. As far as inflation is concerned, during the NDA regime, the inflation rate was 3.9 per cent in the year 2004. Moving further, during the tenure of the UPA, the inflation rate was 9.1 per cent in the year 2009, 12.3 per cent in 2010 and 10.5 per cent in 2011. Likewise, when the NDA again formed the Government, the inflation rate was 6 per cent in 2015 and today it is only 5.5 per cent. It is a universally acknowledged data. This White Paper is going to be a milestone in

parliamentary history. Our country is moving forward under the leadership of the Hon'ble Prime Minister because the Government led by him functions with rectitude and integrity.

***SHRI OM PAVAN RAJENIMBALKAR:**

SHRI E. T. MOHAMMED BASHEER: The Government is trying to present a rosy picture that everything in the country is okay. People are crying because of the recent development that took place in Uttarakhand where 'shoot-at-site' orders have been issued. The whole nation is worried about this issue. These kinds of things should not happen and we have to be very careful about this. The UPA Government made the historic legislation of the Right to Information Act which was a revolutionary move to bring in transparency and curb corruption. You have now clipped the wings and diluted it, and things are turning from bad to worse. Then, the UPA Government came up with a critical legislation of MGNREGA. That was a very important piece of legislation as far as the eradication of poverty is concerned. Besides, the Right to Education Act was landmark legislation. You claim that India is a fast-developing economy. The fact remains that it is a healthy economy for the rich, corporates and that kind of a section of the society. So far as institutions are concerned, many institutions came into existence soon after Independence. Now, these big companies, PSUs, and public properties, all are being sold for a song to the big guns. This Government is humiliating minorities. I urge the Government to reconsider all these things and do justice to all whether they are Muslims, Christians or anybody else. In this country, our youngsters have got a lot of grievances with regard to unemployment. There also, The Government has miserably failed. We call ourselves the biggest democracy but in this country, freedom of the Press is totally curtailed.

**MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE AND
MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF TOURISM (AJAY BHATT)**
intervening said: There was no Government Order relating to the mosque under reference. The action was taken in compliance with the orders of the Honourable Court.

* Please see Supplement

***SHRI S. VENKATESAN:**

DR. SHRIKANT EKNATH SHINDE: The White Paper on the economy has exposed the dark truth of the UPA. I think that this Paper should be renamed as 'Black Paper on Governance. I would like to focus on the reasons behind the economic and policy stagnancy during the UPA regime and how dangerously it compromised our economic and social security. A democratically-elected Government was run by the unconstitutional authorities. I saw the translation of the dreams of Late Bala Saheb Thackeray ji being fulfilled in this very House when the Hon. Minister of Home Affairs abrogated Article 370 in this House. Today I feel that the opposition here is talking about reforms under whose government there was rampant corruption. In the last 10 years, the incumbent Prime Minister has honoured all those who were betrayed by the opposition parties while in power. Today we are passing through *Amritkaal* and the era of developed India. All our economic indicators are positive. Our average inflation rate is 5 per cent which was 8.2 percent during your tenure. Our forex reserves have leapfrogged from 303 billion dollars to 617 billion dollars. Our capital expenditure has increased from Rs. 2 lakh crore to Rs. 9.5 lakh crore and the Non-Performing Asset (NPA) ratio has come down from 16 per cent to 6 per cent and we are the fastest-growing economy in terms of GDP growth. Our defence production has crossed Rs. 1 lakh crore today. We built a defence corridor. Our defence Budget is of Rs. 6 lakh crore. Secondly, we are proud of our capital expenditure today that world-class infrastructure is being developed across the country. The length of the high-speed corridor was 500 kilometers which is 4 thousand kilometres today. The number of airports was 74, which has since more than doubled to 149.

**

**

**

**

**

UTPAL KUMAR SINGH
Secretary General

**Supplement covering the rest of the proceeding is being issued separately.

* Please see Supplement

PRICE: Rs. 12.00© 2024 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debates of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopsis of Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>

Not for Publication
For Members only

LOK SABHA
SUPPLEMENT TO SYNOPSIS OF DEBATES
(Proceedings other than Questions & Answers)

Friday, February 9, 2024 / Magha 20, 1945 (Saka)

MOTION UNDER RULE 342

**

**

**

**

**

SHRI JAYANT SINHA: It is very necessary to present this White Paper before the country. There was a legion of renowned economists in the UPA Government, nevertheless, even then they spoilt the economy. We had no such economists of that calibre, but still, we reformed the economy. During the reign of Atal ji, sanctions were imposed on India. There was an Asian financial crisis, and there was a war in Iraq, despite all these crises, Atal Ji's government had given us a booming economy. The GDP growth rate was 8 percent, the fiscal deficit was around 3-4 percent, and inflation was 3-4 percent at that time. The fiscal deficit was also around 6-8 percent during the UPA era. During the UPA period, capital expenditure had come down to 16 percent, which has now again reached 28 percent. The construction of national highways was only 12 km per day during the UPA reign, which has increased to 28 km per day during our time. We are confident enough to say that our economy is of four trillion dollars, it will cross five trillion and ten trillion too. Our Government has made the banking system very robust. During Atal Ji's Government, the net NPA was almost reduced to 6-8 percent. The UPA had increased it to 16 percent. Now the bank NPA remains around 4 percent. Today our banks have become strong once again after changing the creditor culture through the Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code. Today, the rupee is one of the strongest currencies in the world. The stock market which was at 6 thousand levels ten years ago, is now around 22 thousand.

***SHRIMATI HARSIMRAT KAUR BADAL:** Punjab has always been ahead of the country in all fields. From 2010 to 2017, in seven years, our government made Punjab from an electricity deficit to an electricity surplus State. Three new thermal power plants were started. A wonderful network of roads was created and four-lane and six-lane roads were constructed. Punjab became a developed State and seemed like a foreign country. We developed Punjab in all sectors. schools, colleges and universities were opened. A drinking water facility was provided to every household. Ours was an honest Government. We utilized the revenue judiciously. Now, the present regime has pushed Punjab into a wide array of predicaments. Today you will be shocked to know that Punjab has a debt of Rs. 3.4 lakh crore, the highest in the

** The Speeches made by the other Hon. Members have already been included in the Synopsis (Main).

* Original in Punjabi

country. Prices of eatables have sky-rocketed. Over 10 lakh ration cards of poor people were disbanded. They put Punjab under a thousand crore rupees worth of debt. Advertisements of full pages have been published in all newspapers regarding false achievements of AAP. Similarly, Punjab's money was misused to hire aircraft. A large-scale illegal mining is going on at the cost of the exchequer. The same liquor scam is going to happen in Punjab. In Delhi, people have been caught and sent to jail in the liquor scam. Now the same thing is happening in Punjab, but nobody is touching them. I was given an assurance in the Parliament that they would be investigated. But they have not been touched till date. So, I appeal to the Government to stop this in Punjab also. The drug menace is rampant in Punjab. Our welfare schemes have been discontinued. The High Court had to intervene due to the drug menace.

SHRI ASADUDDIN OWAISI: The average GDP growth in UPA was 6.8 per cent whereas the average GDP growth in this Government has reached to 5.9 per cent. The Fiscal Deficit as a Percentage of GDP was 4.7 percent during the tenure of UPA whereas during this Government, it remained 5.1 percent average. Inflation was 8 percent in the UPA Government whereas, it was 5 percent in this Government, but is it not true that the global oil prices between 2008 and 2014 were more than 100 dollars per barrel, while the prices of oil between 2015 to 2021 were in the range of \$ 55 and \$ 70. If GDP was 5.9 percent during the NDA regime, then what about the rate of unemployment? Why has the Prime Minister not undertaken an employment survey since 2011? The consumption survey has not been conducted since 2017. The dollar was at Rs 43 during the year 2005, while it reached to Rs 83 during 2014. How did it reach to \$ 83? There is a net increase of 40 rupees. The foreign currency reserve was at \$ 294 billion in 2011. By the year 2013, it rose to 256 billion. Health expenditure from pocket which was 69 percent in the year 2005 has increased to 64.2 percent in the year 2014. In the White Paper at least you give the data for the year 2020. This white paper is more rhetoric than substantive. Make a White Paper showing the number of Muslims including Akhlaq who were mob lynched during the years 2014 to 2024. How many houses were demolished by bulldozers? Finally, during the UPA regime, there was provision of free coaching in minorities budget, which they have stopped. They closed the Maulana Azad Foundation, they stopped the Maulana Azad Fellowship. They have abolished Madrasa education. During 2014 there was a Muslim Minister, now there is none.

SHRI RAM MOHAN NAIDU KINJARAPU: White Paper talks about corruption before 2014. The biggest corruption happened in the State of Andhra Pradesh which was not mentioned in the White Paper. In the period between 2004

and 2014 corruption was at the peak in the State of Andhra Pradesh. That is why the people of Andhra Pradesh voted against corruption and brought in the present Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh. In the country also, they have brought in the present Prime Minister so that they can deal with this kind of corruption that is happening in the country and in the State also. From 2014 to 2019, not a single case of corruption was reported in the State of Andhra Pradesh. There might have been differences between the State and the Centre. They were purely in terms of how to make progress in the country and in the State. In 2019 Mr. Jagan Mohan Reddy came back to power by fooling the people of Andhra Pradesh, by giving them false assurances. He came back to power and now the same culture which was happening from 2004 to 2014 is prevailing again in the State of Andhra Pradesh. Liquor mafia has started in the State of Andhra Pradesh. The entire sand tender is being given to one company with dubious tenders. The Central Government should have zero tolerance for people who are involved in corrupt practices. The Steel Plant in Vizag which is under RINL should be merged with SAIL. Vizag Steel Plant is the jewel of the crown. I would like to thank the Central Government for announcing the Bharat Ratna for the three most important people in the country. From our State, on our behalf and on behalf of the Telugu people, we would like to request that Nandamuri Taraka Rama Rao Garu should also be granted Bharat Ratna. He had been working for the backward classes.

DR. DNV SENTHILKUMAR S.: This White Paper is nothing but a concoction of twisted facts and selective memory conveniently ignoring the failures and shortcomings of the present administration. Why is there a deafening silence on the people's issue of price rise, unemployment and economic inequality? I would like to place on the record that this Government has failed to bring back black money, demonetization, printing of Rs. 2000 notes and withdrawal, farmers laws, creation of PSUs, giving Rs. 15 lakh which they promised, two crore jobs, bullet train, price rise, making railways on a par with airports. Everything above was a big failure.

SHRI ANUBHAV MOHANTY: Odisha's longstanding demands have not been addressed by both the Government-UPA Government and NDA Government. I urge upon both sides and especially the ruling Government to look into these matters. The first issue is regarding not sharing cess and surcharge with the State. Odisha have got only Rs. 33,151.38 crore out of a total of 7,32,141.91 crore. The second issue is regarding not giving any portion of the clean energy or coal cess despite being the second largest producer of coal in the country. My third point is the neglect shown towards the plight of the poor in Odisha. Seven lakh houses to be given under PMGAY are still pending. Centre is neglecting the tribals, farmers and

artisans of Odisha. The government had not removed 18 percent GST on Kendu leaves. The Khurda Road-Bolangir Rail line project was sanctioned in the financial year 1994-95, but still it is not completed. The next point is regarding not increasing teledensity and internet density, particularly in rural areas. The State required at least Rs. 2,000 crore immediately to carry on its ongoing restoration and rehabilitation activities in the cyclone and flood-hit districts after Cyclone Phailin. Special category status for Odisha has not been granted. Bharat Ratna should be conferred on Biju Babu.

SHRIMATI SUPRIYA SADANAND SULE: This White Paper was a comparison of two Government tenures of a decade of each. There was nothing but allegations against the previous Government. This White Paper is not a White Paper. It is a politically coloured paper. The unemployment rate during UPA was 2.2 per cent, while during the present Government, it is 6.6 per cent. The average GDP growth rate during the previous Government was 8.13 percent which is 5.6 percent now. Regarding the fiscal deficit data, if you take the entire tenures together, the fiscal deficit during Dr. Manmohan Singh Ji's Government was 4.48 percent while during this Government it was 5.8 per cent. Jan Dhan was a product which was started earlier and there were 34 crore bank accounts. Eventually, they took it to 51 crore accounts which is not a great achievement. Average expenditure during the UPA Government was 14.68 per cent of the GDP while during this Government it was 12.94 per cent. They always say that spending has gone up which is not the case. Be it education and health care during the earlier Government, if you comparatively take the cumulative figure, the budget outlay of the whole year, the spending on health care and education is much lesser now than it used to be before. They have started a cashless economy that they wanted to and they have started a digital economy. In the digital sphere, you know what has happened to Paytm. It is almost like money laundering through Paytm. So, what is the Government doing for the economy? There is a Bhim app now. The Bhim app is hardly used by people. The IT Committee report has already flagged this. So, these are very serious concerns. Let us do something constructive and serve this nation.

SUSHRI SUNITA DUGGAL: There were scams in the previous Government. What was the image of the leaders, then? Especially, the youth did not want to join politics at all. Today, there is a lot of enthusiasm among the youth about the Hon'ble Prime Minister. A lot of young people want to join politics now. About 2 lakh 80 thousand crore rupees have been given to farmers under the Pradhan Mantri Samman Nidhi Yojna. If I talk about Sirsa Lok Sabha constituency, after paying a premium of thirty thousand crore rupees, they have got back about one and a half lakh crore rupees. Health camps were also organized in the Viksit Sankalp

Bharat Yatra. A number of people got gas connections while many others got Ayushman cards there. About borrowings, I would like to say that if and only if one's balance sheet is strong, only then is any loan given to one.

SHRI VIJAY KUMAR HANSDAK: This is a white paper related to the dark clouds that have been hovering around the country for ten years and there is no mention of demonetization, the loss of the economy, the foreign policy of the country, China's continuous intrusion inside the country, the misuse of ED in it. In the tribal-dominated state of Jharkhand, an attempt was made to forcibly bring down a tribal Chief Minister. Executive, Income Tax, CBI, and ED have been grossly misused in ten years. They have failed to meet the promises they made before 2014. They are ending the reservation given to SC, ST, and OBC in lieu of atrocities done on them for thousands of years through privatization. The Government is manipulating to award of contracts, tenders etc to their favourites and they are calling themselves corruption-free. The Government is running because of ED, CBI and Income Tax, otherwise, they do not have the strength to fight with any party.

DR. SANJAY JAISWAL: Before 2004, India emerged as a strong economic power with strong policies of Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, for the first time four-lane roads were constructed, roads were constructed in every village, Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan initiative was started. The 5-year tenure after Atal ji was full of scams. Inflation touched the double-digit mark. During the tenure of the coalition government, the Commonwealth scam, 2G telecom scam, INX Media scam, Emerald deal scam, Pilates Basic trainer aircraft scam, Hawk aircraft scam, Adarsh Housing scam, AgustaWestland scam, Saradha Chit Fund scam in Bengal took place. The UPA government had only one job, borrow a lot and do not spend that money on infrastructure, but distribute it to their loved ones. We had no ammunition, they were not in a position to provide night vision goggles-like equipment. Our government exported arms and ammunition worth Rs 26 thousand crore. We manufactured arms and ammunition worth Rs 1 lakh crore indigenously. Today our government gives the befitting reply to the enemy country. The Opposition has brought a Black Paper but there is not a single word against our ministers during the tenure of last ten years.

SHRIMATI NAVNEET RAVI RANA: During the 50-year tenure of Congress government 75 airports were built and in the last 10 years 74 airports have been built. In 50 years, 98,000 km of roads and highways were built and in the tenure of this Government, 50,000 km of highways have been built. 400 Vande Bharat trains are currently running. This government has opened 600 Eklavya schools for tribal children. 262 medical colleges have been built in the last 10 years, the government has also set up 17 AIIMS in the last 10 years. Only 16 IITs, in 50

years, and now 7 new IITs have been built in the last 10 years. Through Prime Minister Awas Yojana, 4 crore people have been given houses since 2014 till date. Shri Ram Mandir and Kashi were only trailers, Gyanvapi and Mathura are yet to come.

SHRI RAMESH BIDHURI: It is the misfortune of the country that the Congress Government completely indulged in corruption for 60 years. Therefore, the White Paper had to be brought. Our government has provided houses to four crore poor people. Pension was given to 61 crore people. People benefited from DBT. The number of Jan Aushadhi Kendras increased manifold. Maternity benefit is given to 3.6 crore people across the country today. The number of metro trains has also increased a lot. Water facility was provided to every house. The number of start-ups has increased from 300 to 1 crore 70. In 2004, the price of wheat flour was Rs.10 per kg, it was increased to Rs.30 per kg due to corruption. Through the Ayushman Bharat Yojana, the coverage of Rs 5 lakh is being provided to every poor Person after the opening of Jan Dhan Account.

SHRI ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY: The intent and purpose of bringing this kind of a White Paper is simply not convincing. This kind of White Paper was brought only with the objective of tarnishing the 10 years of the UPA Government. It is nothing but an election manifesto with the objective of securing electoral brownie points. In 1947-48, the per capita income of our country was Rs. 247. In 2011-12, the per-capita income increased to Rs 64,361. In 1951, the literacy rate in our country was 12 percent. In 2011, it was 73 percent. The UPA Government established the Right to Education Act in 2009 ensuring education as a fundamental right for every child. The National Food Security Act implemented by the UPA Government ensures the right to food for every individual. Demonetization is a failure of the Government. Due to demonetization, 15 lakh labourers lost their jobs within four months. India's infrastructure has grown remarkably since Independence including extensive rail and road networks, connecting numerous villages and towns with electricity and all-weather roads. India leads in mobile subscriptions globally thanks to the telecom revolution initiated by Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi. Congress believed that inclusive governance is crucial for inclusive growth. Mahatma Gandhi envisioned the Panchayati Raj as the cornerstone of our democracy. In 1959, Hon. Prime Minister Jawaharlal Nehru launched nationwide Panchayati Raj in Nagaur, Rajasthan on Gandhi Jayanti. Prime Minister late Rajiv Gandhi emphasised the need for constitutional recognition and empowerment of Panchayati Raj. During the Congress era, Swaminathan contributed to making the Green Revolution successful. The coal import scandal is traced back to December 2021. After the Vijay Mallya

scam, many such scams took place. Social stability, social cohesion, and social peace are the fundamental conditions for the growth of an economy.

SHRI N. K. RAMACHANDRAN: The White Paper is a political attempt to ignore the valuable efforts of the previous UPA Government and the contributions of the renowned economists, scientists and experts of the country during the period between 2004 and 2014. After 10 years of NDA Government in office, making baseless allegations against the previous Government is unfair, improper, unjust and against all basic tenets of Parliamentary democracy. You are over-confident that you will come back. The economy is in a better position and India will become the third largest economy by 2029. If you are very hopeful and confident of all these political situations and the economic situation, what are the things to be disclosed to the public by means of this White Paper? It is totally untimely. Another reason I expect is that you are very much apprehensive about the ground reality. The ground reality among the electorate is different than the rosy picture that you have given through the White Picture as well as through the Budget and through the President's Address. You are very apprehensive about the electorate, about the basic elements regarding exponential growth in unemployment. There is a spiralling rise in prices of petrol, diesel, cooking gas and other essential commodities due to inflation. Actual poverty is increasing. So, you want to shift the responsibility. Regarding the guarantees, I would like to state something. Further, you are apprehensive and worried about the assurances which you had given during the 2014 general election and the 2019 general election. Coming to the White Paper, we are ready to have a comparative study of 10 years of the UPA Government as well as 10 years of the NDA Government. Sir, now I would like to speak on the performance of the previous Government. The legislative history of the Indian Parliament has never seen revolutionary legislation which had happened during the Government under Dr. Manmohan Singh. One of those revolutionary legislations was the Right to Information Act. All such other revolutionary legislations like the Right to Education as a Fundamental Right, Forest Rights Act, MGNREGA, and Food Security Act, show that though the Government was having a minimal and nominal majority, still the Government had performed in a good manner. Instead of appreciating the wonderful performance of the previous UPA Government during the period from 2004 to 2014, the present Government is blaming and making allegations against that Government after ten years in office.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN (THE MINISTER OF FINANCE AND MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS) replying said: I thank you for the opportunity, to answer some of the issues raised by the hon. Members but also focus on some of the critical aspects of the White Paper. I repeat

that the White Paper is a serious document with documentary evidence for everything that is said in it. This document is placed with the intent that the House will be informed of the ten years literally dedicated effort to get this Government to work in such a way that the economy is back on rails. The two tracks which we have followed since 2014 are one to remove all the hurdles, and all the misgovernance and equally focus on reforms so that the economy can move forward. I challenge anyone who says that this document has anything which is baseless. Everything is backed with evidence. The Hon. Prime Minister had very clearly said in the year 2015-16 that we did not want to bring a White Paper at that time. Why has it been brought now? We have completed ten years of governance, ten years of sincere effort to clear up the economy. We also took every step which had to be taken to clean up the system. We have reached the place of 5th largest economy and sooner we will be becoming the 3rd largest economy. Our ten years can, therefore, be periodically compared with their ten years. Now, I will just focus myself on three issues and I will elaborate on those issues. I want to explain three issues: how national security was compromised in those ten years; how the Environment Ministry had become a bottleneck, and finally how the leadership failed the country. The critical shortage of ammunition and defence equipment was the main feature of 2014 when we inherited the economy. I can tell as to how much corruption was rampant in defence. Our Armed Forces were totally ignored. Then we took corrective measures. The Defence Budget has doubled during the last ten years. The FDI limit in defence production has been raised to 74 per cent. All the production units of the Ordnance Factory Board have been converted into seven Defence PSUs. We have increased the business of HAL to four lakh Crore rupees. The value of defence production in 2022-23 has crossed one lakh crore rupees. Defence exports are at an all-time high. Delays in grant of environmental clearances increased on an average from 86 days to 316 days during 2011-2014. The image of India as a business destination went for a toss. We brought in transparency. We standardized and streamlined Environmental Impact Assessment studies. The average time for clearance and the average time for approvals to be cleared at the Central level has been reduced to 70 days. Forest cover increased by 50,000 square kilometres. Globally India stands 4th in renewable power, 4th in wind power and 5th in solar power. We have progressed so much that there has been a 30-fold increase in Solar energy capacity since 2014. The target of achieving 40 per cent renewable capacity addition has been fulfilled nine years ahead of time. Leadership problem is the key to the 10 years of UPA's mismanagement and scams. Unaccountable unanswerable and unconstitutional use of power led to these scams. Many Hon'ble Members have talked about the misuse of Black Money, CBI and ED. The PMLA law is enforced by the Enforcement Directorate. There were 102 prosecutions from 2005 to 2014 which implies that the law was not implemented. The Enforcement Directorate was treated as a caged bird. We gave

full discretion to the ED to do their work and stop money laundering. There were 1200 cases of prosecution. We have 58 cases of conviction during our term. There was zero restitution during their tenure. We have brought back 16,333 crore rupees. Red corner notices have been issued to 24 people during the last 9 years of our tenure. Not a single person was declared a fugitive during their tenure. We have declared 12 persons as fugitives. We have brought back 906.74 crore rupees from the fugitive offender. They jeopardised the right of our farmers and poor families to food under the Bali declaration and are now giving contradictory statements. Labour markets have witnessed falling unemployment rates declining from 5.8 per cent in 2018-19 to 3.2 per cent in 2022-23. The unemployment rate particularly for graduates has also declined. The decline has been even sharper for female graduates. There is an investment of 1.07 lakh crore rupees in the PLI Scheme. 8,82,191 Central Government vacancies have been filled up in the last nine years. Regional Recruitment Boards gave Government jobs to 4,30,592 youth between 2014 and 2023. Under UPA, the retail inflation was more than 9 per cent. Our retail inflation was mostly 5 per cent. The vision of our leadership is to make India a developed nation by 2047. Our goal is all for inclusive growth and to keep the nation above our personal interest.

The substitute motions moved were negatived.

UTPAL KUMAR SINGH
Secretary General

© 2024 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NOTE: It is the verbatim Debates of the Lok Sabha and not the Synopsis that should be considered authoritative.

English and Hindi versions of Synopsis of Debates are also available at <http://loksabha.nic.in>